



PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

20 SEPTEMBER 2018

REPORT OF THE SERVICE DIRECTOR, PLANNING

PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

Members are asked to determine the planning application outlined below:

APPLICATION NO: 17/1236/10 – CONSTRUCTION OF A DETACHED BUNGALOW AT 21 TRENOS GARDENS, LLANHARAN, PONTYCLUN

1. PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

Members are asked to consider the determination of the above planning application.

2. RECOMMENDATION

That Members consider the report in respect of the application and determine the application having regard to the advice given.

3. BACKGROUND

This application was last reported to the Planning and Development Control Committee of 16th August 2018 and a copy of the original report is attached as **APPENDIX A**.

During this meeting, Members resolved that they were minded to refuse the application contrary to the recommendation of the Service Director, Planning, for the reasons that the form and layout of the development were inappropriate and the parking and access arrangements to serve both the new and existing dwellings were inadequate.

As a consequence it was resolved to defer determination of the application for a further report to highlight the potential strengths and weaknesses of taking a decision contrary to officer recommendation.

4. PLANNING ASSESSMENT

Whilst the view of Members is fully acknowledged, it is considered that the proposed bungalow is acceptable in principle, being located within the settlement boundary and in a sustainable location close to public transport, shops and services.

With the construction of bungalows being rare and noting the continuing pressures for residential development within the Southern Strategy Area, it is considered that the subdivision of the plot would represent an efficient use of land and have been beneficial to potential older residents seeking both single storey accommodation and a smaller garden space to look after.

Furthermore being of single storey construction the mass of the bungalow would be low and positioned where it would not have a detrimental impact on the outlook from neighbouring dwellings or cause overlooking.

In respect of the access and parking issues, Members will note that the Transportation Section revisited the site at their request, in order to verify that the shared driveway and parking provision was acceptable. The Transportation Section was of the view that the proposed arrangement was indeed acceptable, albeit that a condition should require details of the driveway design to be submitted for approval.

It is therefore considered that the development would remain in accordance with Policies AW2, AW5, AW6, AW10 and SSA13 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

However, Members concerns about the site layout and access are also acknowledged, and in respect of the latter, it is clear that the front of the site is constrained, making vehicle access tight.

In particular that part of the driveway adjoining the existing vehicular crossover would have to be shared and there is concern about the practicality of maintaining access in perpetuity, if both existing and new properties were in separate ownership.

A further concern about the retained parking for no.21 is that it would have only two off-street parking spaces, one of which would be provided by a garage. Whilst the Council's SPG for Access, Circulation and Parking Requirements recognises that a garage can provide a parking space, they are not always used for the purposes of parking and may be physically incapable of housing larger vehicles.

Such an outcome could cause the displacement of vehicles to park on the public highway, where space is already constrained by the number of driveways of neighbouring properties which gain access from the turning head, causing a highway safety issue.

The access issues help to demonstrate that although the garden of no.21 is of large by modern standards and would be suitably sized for accommodating an additional bungalow, the proposed layout would not be ideal.

The shape of the plot and the position of the neighbouring boundary means that the new dwelling would have to be set back from no.21, giving an impression of being 'tucked behind' the existing dwelling, and with the front

garden of no.21 being laid with additional hard surfacing. This would not reflect the general layout of the wider development and the new house would not, therefore, relate well to the street scene. If the proposal were for a residential annexe, this concern would be of less relevance since a relationship of subservience would be expected and a separate access not required.

If, having considered the above advice, Members remain of a mind to refuse planning permission, it is suggested that the following reasons for refusal would be reflect the concerns previously raised.

By virtue of its siting, the proposed dwelling would not relate well to the arrangement of existing and neighbouring properties; having an unacceptable relationship of subservience and failing to reflect the appearance and character of the street scene. The development would therefore be contrary to Policies AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan

The proposed access arrangement and off-street parking provision for both new and existing dwellings would be of an inadequate design, resulting in vehicular movements and on-street parking to the detriment of highway safety. The development would therefore not comply with Policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan and the Council's SPG for Access, Circulation and Parking Requirements.



APPENDIX A

PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

16 AUGUST 2018

REPORT OF THE SERVICE DIRECTOR, PLANNING

PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

Members are asked to determine the planning application outlined below:

APPLICATION NO: 17/1236/10
(GH)
APPLICANT: Ms Williams
DEVELOPMENT: Construction of a detached bungalow.
LOCATION: 21 TRENOS GARDENS, LLANHARAN, PONTYCLUN,
CF72 9SZ
DATE REGISTERED: 13/12/2017
ELECTORAL DIVISION: Brynna

RECOMMENDATION: GRANT SUBJECT TO THE CONDITIONS BELOW:

REASONS:

The proposed new dwelling represents an acceptable form of infill development and would be located within the settlement boundary and in a sustainable location. The design and layout of the dwelling would have a minimal impact upon the appearance of the street scene, provide sufficient garden space for new and existing residents, and due to its scale, would not cause harm to the amenity of neighbouring residents. Consequently, the development is considered to comply with LDP Policies AW2, AW5, AW6, AW10 and SSA13.

REASON APPLICATION REPORTED TO COMMITTEE

Members determined to defer this application at the Planning Committee of 19th July 2018, in order to seek further advice from The Transportation Section.

Revised observations have been received from Highways, as noted further below, and the application is recommended for approval subject to additional conditions in respect of the shared driveway access and a construction method statement.

APPLICATION DETAILS

Full planning permission is sought for the construction of a single bungalow on a parcel of land which currently forms part of the residential garden curtilage of no. 21 Trenos Gardens.

The existing plot would be sub-divided with the proposed dwelling being located to the north of the existing dwelling. The proposed dwelling would be set towards the most south-eastern part of the new plot and set back from the front elevation of the existing dwelling by approximately 9m.

The bungalow would measure 8.4m in width by 10.5m in depth with a pitched roof design rising from 2.9m at the eaves to a height of 4.7m at the ridge. External materials would consist of smooth white render with a feature panel of reconstructed stone to the front elevation, concrete interlocking roof tiles and white uPVC windows and doors.

The dwelling would accommodate an open-plan living room/kitchen/diner, three bedrooms and a family bathroom. Private outdoor amenity space would be provided to the east-facing rear and north-facing side elevation. Three off-street car parking spaces would be provided to the front of the dwelling with access off the turning head at Trenos Gardens.

SITE APPRAISAL

The application site relates to an irregular shaped parcel of land that currently forms the residential garden curtilage of no. 21 Trenos Gardens, Llanharan. The dwelling is located towards the most southern part of the plot with extensive gardens being located to the north facing side and east facing rear elevations. Off-street car parking is provided at the front of the property as well as within the integral garage.

The surrounding area is characterised by residential properties that vary in terms of their scale and design. Properties in this part of Trenos Gardens are predominantly single storey, semi-detached or detached properties that have been externally finished in white render and stone panelling.

The nearest properties to the site include no. 22 Trenos Gardens which is located immediately to the western boundary and no. 23 Trenos Place which is located immediately to the eastern boundary.

PLANNING HISTORY

There are no recent applications on record associated with this site

PUBLICITY

The application has been advertised by direct notification to six neighbouring properties and notices were erected on site.

Three letters of objection, together with a fourth letter of representation, have been received, with concerns summarised as follows:

- The development would cause noise, disturbance and visual intrusion;
- Potential damage to neighbouring dwellings during construction
- Poor access and with parking awkward and limited on site, with on-street parking opportunities reduced;
- Diminishment of amenity and domination of outlook;
- Incorrect plans using land in third party ownership

CONSULTATION

Coal Authority

The CMRA submitted on behalf of the applicant is acceptable

Drainage

No objections subject to a condition in respect of drainage details

Public Health and Protection

No objections, but conditions are recommended in respect of noise, dust, waste and hours of operation. However, with the exception of the latter it is considered that these issues can be captured within an informative note.

Highways

No objections subject to conditions

Wales and West Utilities

No objection

Dwr Cymru Welsh Water

Objection due to capacity issues with the combined sewer

No other consultation responses have been received within the statutory period.

POLICY CONTEXT

Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan

The application site lies within the settlement boundary for Llanharan

Policy CS2 - sets out criteria for development in the Southern Strategy Area.

Policy AW1 – sets out the criteria for new housing proposals.

Policy AW2 - supports development in sustainable locations.

Policy AW5 - sets out criteria for new development in relation to amenity and accessibility.

Policy AW6 - requires development to involve a high quality design and to make a positive contribution to place making, including landscaping.

Policy AW10 - development proposals must overcome any harm to public health, the environment or local amenity.

Policy SSA13 – identifies criteria for assessment of development proposals within settlement boundaries.

Supplementary Planning Guidance

Access, Circulation and Parking
Design and Placemaking

National Guidance

In the determination of planning applications, regard should also be given to the requirements of National Planning Policy which are not duplicated in the Local Development Plan, particularly where National Planning Policy provides a more up to date and comprehensive policy on certain topics.

Planning Policy Wales Chapter 3 (Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions), Chapter 4 (Planning for Sustainability) and Chapter 9 (Housing), set out the Welsh Government's policy on planning issues relevant to the determination of the application.

Other policy guidance considered:

PPW Technical Advice Note 12 - Design

REASONS FOR REACHING THE RECOMMENDATION

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purposes of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Furthermore, applications that are not in accordance with relevant policies in the plan should not be allowed, unless material considerations justify the grant of planning permission.

Main Issues:

Principle of the proposed development

The application proposes the construction of a single residential dwelling with dedicated off-street car parking on a plot of land that is situated within the defined settlement boundary and within an established residential area. As such, it is considered that the development of the site for residential purposes would be

compatible with surrounding land uses. Therefore the principle of the proposal is considered to be acceptable subject to an assessment of the criteria set out below.

Impact on the character and appearance of the area

The proposed dwelling would be set within a corner plot with ample space being provided around the dwelling for private amenity space and off-street car parking provision whilst also retaining sufficient amenity space and off-street parking for the existing dwelling. It is therefore considered that the dwelling could be comfortably accommodated at the site without resulting in a sense of overdevelopment.

The proposed dwelling would be set back approximately 9m back from the front elevation of the existing dwelling and, given the position of the site and its relationship with no's 21 and 22 Trenos Gardens, it is not considered that the dwelling would form an overly prominent addition to the wider street scene. In addition to this, the dwelling would be single storey and of a similar scale, design and finish to existing properties in the immediate vicinity and it is therefore not considered that it would have an adverse impact on the character and appearance of the surrounding area.

Taking the above into consideration, the proposal is considered to comply with the relevant criteria of Policies AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

Impact on neighbouring occupiers

The proposed dwelling would be sited in close proximity to no's 21 & 22 Trenos Gardens and no. 23 Trenos Place, but would not be considered to have an adverse impact on the residential amenity and privacy of these properties.

The dwelling would be sited to the north of no. 21 and would be single storey in height, thereby having no overshadowing or overbearing impact on that property. In addition to this, there would be no habitable windows within the south facing side elevation that would give rise to significant levels of overlooking. Details submitted with the application also indicate that timber fencing would be erected along the boundary which would further reduce any potential impact.

Whilst the dwelling would incorporate habitable windows in the front elevation which would face towards no. 22, these would be sited approximately 16.5m away and would primarily overlook the blank side elevation of that property. In addition to this, the existing garage of no. 22 and the existing 1.8m high timber fence along the common boundary, either retained or replaced, would predominantly screen any potential views. For similar reasons, the distance between these dwellings would ensure that the proposed dwelling would not result in any overbearing or overshadowing impact.

The dwelling would be sited approximately 9m away from the side elevation of no. 23 Trenos Place which is a two-storey property. A 1.8m high timber fence and a single storey garage lie between the two properties and it is therefore not considered that

the proposed dwelling would result in any overbearing, overshadowing or overlooking impact on that property.

A letter from the occupant of no. 23 Trenos Place was received, suggesting that the red line boundary on the site location plan is incorrect on account of the inclusion a strip of land that forms the residential garden of that property. The applicant has subsequently submitted the title deed and land registry plans for the site which reflects the red line boundary on the site location plan and the Council are therefore satisfied that the correct ownership certificates have been completed (Certificate A). In any case, issues relating to land ownership would be a private matter between the two parties involved and not reason to refuse the application.

Taking the above into consideration, the proposal would not have an adverse impact on the residential amenity or privacy of surrounding neighbouring properties and it would therefore comply with the relevant criteria of Policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

Highways and accessibility

The application has been subject to consultation with the Council's Transportation Section with a view to assessing the impact of the proposal on highway safety in the vicinity of the site. The response received indicates that the proposed dwelling would be served from the existing turning head in a similar manner to no. 21 Trenos Gardens and other neighbouring properties in the vicinity

There is some concern with regards to the creation of additional vehicular reversing movements to and from Trenos Gardens. However, when considering the low trafficked nature of Trenos Gardens and that all other properties on the street are served in a similar way, the concern is not significant enough to warrant a highway objection.

It is noted that there is a difference in level between the proposed driveway and the neighbouring dwelling, no. 22 Trenos Gardens, and a retaining wall of modest height will be required to facilitate the proposed driveway. There is concern that vehicles may leave the proposed driveway and drop off the retaining wall whilst undertaking the required reversing movements to or from the public highway. However, this concern could be overcome by provision of vehicle containment along the boundary of the proposal and the neighbouring dwelling.

In terms of parking, the proposal is for a three bedroom dwelling which has an off-street car parking requirement of three spaces. The drawings submitted indicate that the proposed driveway is long enough to accommodate three vehicles and, as such, the proposal is considered to be acceptable in this regard.

However, in the light of concerns raised by Members, The Transportation Section were asked to reconsider the matter of the proposed access and parking arrangements at the site. Accordingly, the section revisited the site and revised observations were received.

The comments have reflected that the proposal will require an element of the existing driveway of no. 21 to become shared with the proposed dwelling. The shared element is required to facilitate unimpeded access to both dwellings and there is concern that this section of driveway is not identified on the submitted plan. The required shared element of the driveway must be demarked with edging kerbs to ensure longevity of the boundary line between the shared and private elements of the driveway.

Consequently, no highway objection is raised, subject to additional conditions requiring the submission of driveway design details and a construction method statement, prior to the commencement of development

Dwr Cymru Welsh Water - Drainage issues

As noted above, the proposal has been subject to an objection from DCWW on the basis that the public sewer system serving the locality is at capacity, and would be unable to receive additional flows. DCWW contends that a further connection would cause detriment and increase the frequency and volume of spills being experienced on the downstream network, although no evidence has been provided to confirm such assertions.

Subsequently, DCWW has stated that their objection could be overcome by delivering a surface water removal scheme, i.e. removing the surface water run-off from an existing property currently draining to the combined sewer, to allow the foul water from the new dwelling to connect. Although DCWW has suggested a condition in this regard the LPA's view is that it would not meet the Welsh Government's 'six tests' which are stipulated within Circular WGC 016/2014, inasmuch as a surface water offset scheme could be dependent on an agreement with an unknown third party and/or land outside the control of the applicant.

This matter has been subject to clarification with the Council's Legal Section which has noted that Section 106 of the Water Industry Act 1991 provides developers with a right to connect to the public sewers regardless of capacity issues. This right was confirmed by the Supreme Court in the matter of Barratt Homes Ltd v Welsh Water (2009), although the difficulties that the decision would cause for sewage undertakers were recognised. Furthermore, DCWW has a duty under Section 94(1) of the same Act to provide, improve and extend such a system to ensure that the area is and continues to be effectively drained.

In such a situation, it is common for Local Planning Authorities to apply a Grampian condition to any planning consent which, for example, would prevent beneficial occupation of a dwelling until capacity improvement works have been undertaken by the sewage undertaker - in this case DCWW. Unfortunately this would not apply in this case because a Grampian condition has to be applied where capacity works are programmed within the five year investment plans to which the industry operates. DCWW's current investment programme runs from 2015 to 2020, with no planned upgrades for the Llanharan and Brynna area, despite the degree of development identified prior to the adoption of the LDP.

The view of the Legal Officer is that DCWW's objection is a material matter that needs to be considered, alongside the LDP and all other material considerations, but that the LPA is entitled to approve the application if the proposed development is judged to be acceptable. Consequently, since the application is otherwise deemed to be acceptable in planning terms and has not been subject to objections from other statutory consultees; it is considered reasonable that a standard drainage pre-commencement condition should be applied and that to withhold determination on the basis of DCWW's objection would be unreasonable.

Notwithstanding all of the above, the drainage condition would still require the submission of foul and surface water details for approval; which could incorporate a surface water offset proposal, and would still be subject to consultation with DCWW, prior to being discharged.

Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) Liability

The Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) was introduced in Rhondda Cynon Taf from 31 December 2014.

The application is for development of a kind that is liable for a charge under the CIL Regulations 2010 as amended. The application lies within Zone 3 of Rhondda Cynon Taf's Residential Charging Zones, where there is a liability of £85 / sqm for residential development (including extensions to dwellings over 100 sqm).

The CIL (including indexation) for this development is expected to be £8,905.44.

Conclusion

It is considered the proposal would not have a significant impact on the character and appearance of the locality or upon the residential amenity of the surrounding neighbouring properties, and would be acceptable in terms of highways safety issues. The application is therefore considered to comply with Policies AW2, AW5, AW6, AW10 and SSA13 of the Local Development Plan.

RECOMMENDATION: GRANT SUBJECT TO THE CONDITIONS BELOW:

CONDITIONS

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of five years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with Sections 91 and 93 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2. The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the approved drawing numbers SK02, SK03 and SK04, and documents received by the Local Planning Authority on 15th November 2015, unless otherwise to be approved and superseded by details required by any other condition attached to this consent.

Reason: To ensure compliance with the approved plans and documents and to clearly define the scope of the permission.

3. No development shall commence until details of a scheme for the disposal of foul and surface water has been submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The scheme shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details prior to the beneficial use of the development and retained in perpetuity.

Reason: To ensure that drainage from the proposed development does not cause or exacerbate any adverse condition on the development site, adjoining properties, environment and existing infrastructure arising from inadequate drainage, in accordance with Policy AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

4. Notwithstanding the submitted plan, no works shall commence on site until full engineering design and details of the Private Shared Access serving the existing dwelling and the proposed has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The approved details shall be implemented on site prior to beneficial occupation of the proposed dwelling.

Reason: To ensure the adequacy of access serving the existing bungalow and the proposed dwelling in the interests of highway safety.

5. No development shall take place, including any works of site clearance, until a Construction Method Statement has been submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority to provide for;
 - a) the management of vehicular and pedestrian traffic,
 - b) loading and unloading of plant and materials,
 - c) storage of plant and materials used in constructing the development,
 - d) wheel cleansing facilities,

The approved Construction Method Statement shall be adhered to throughout the development process unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority

6. The driveway shall be constructed in permanent materials and retained for the purpose of the parking of vehicles only unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure that vehicles are parked off the highway, in the interests of road safety.

7. Surface water run-off from the proposed development shall not discharge onto the public highway or connected to any highway drainage system unless otherwise agreed in writing by the LPA.

Reason: To prevent overloading the existing highway drainage system and potential flooding and in the interests of highway safety.

8. HGV's deliveries used as part of the development shall be restricted to 09:00am to 16:30pm on weekdays and 09:00am to 13:00pm on Saturdays, with no deliveries on Sundays and Bank Holidays, unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the safety and free flow of traffic.

9. During the construction phase of the development the hours of work shall be restricted to the following:

Monday to Friday	08.00 to 18.00 hours
Saturday	08.00 to 13.00 hours
Sunday and Bank Holidays	Not At All

Reason: In the interests of the amenity of other residents, in accordance with Policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

=====