

**RHONDDA CYNON TAF COUNTY BOROUGH COUNCIL**

**CABINET**

**23<sup>rd</sup> JUNE 2016**

**MAESYFFYNNON RESIDENTIAL CARE HOME**

**REPORT OF THE GROUP DIRECTOR, COMMUNITY AND CHILDREN'S SERVICES, IN DISCUSSION WITH THE RELEVANT PORTFOLIO HOLDER, COUNCILLOR FOREY**

**Author: Neil Elliott, Service Director, Adult Services. Tel. No. 01443 444603**

**1. PURPOSE OF THIS REPORT**

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to outline the results of the consultation exercise and supporting equality impact assessment in relation to Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home and to consider options for its future development and use.

**2. RECOMMENDATIONS**

It is recommended that Cabinet:

- 2.1 Considers the outcome of the consultation, any potential impact on equalities issues and other matters as outlined in the report and the appendices, in respect of the preferred option relating to the future of, and provision of services at, Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home.
- 2.2 Supports the recommendation to proceed with implementation of the preferred option namely to permanently close the Home and develop alternative extra care housing provision on the current site.
- 2.3 Subject to the above, agree that officers open dialogue with potential Housing Provider partners to implement the preferred option and report any matters to Cabinet and Council in respect of funding requirements linked to the Capital Programme as appropriate.

**3. REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 3.1 In October 2015, Cabinet approved the temporary closure of Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home due to an unacceptable risk of a major breakdown of the Home's mechanical services as well as the safe transfer of residents to alternative homes whilst options for the future of the Home were investigated costed and appraised.

- 3.2 In February 2016, Cabinet considered options for the future of Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home developed by officers and approved to carry out a public consultation with regards to its preferred option for the Home, namely to permanently close Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home and develop alternative extra care housing provision on the current site of the Home.
- 3.3 A public consultation on the Cabinet's preferred option was carried out from the 11<sup>th</sup> April to 23<sup>rd</sup> May 2016. The consultation results are provided in Section 6 of this report.
- 3.4 A decision is now required on the long term future of Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home and proposed service provision, in light of the results of the options appraisal and the outcome of the public consultation.

#### **4. BACKGROUND**

- 4.1 Maesyffynnon is a 26 bed residential care home for elderly people, located in Aberaman. The Home was constructed in the 1960's and over the years has been subject to regular planned maintenance. However, as with all care homes of this age there is a requirement for significant refurbishment and upgrade work to be undertaken relating, in particular to, the replacement of the Home's mechanical services and boiler plant.
- 4.2 In light of the significant building maintenance issues, Cabinet on 6<sup>th</sup> October 2015 agreed to the temporary closure of the Home and the transfer of residents to alternative appropriate placements, whilst options for the future of the Home were fully investigated by officers. At the time of this decision, there were 19 permanent residents living at the Home and all of them were transferred to alternative appropriate care homes.
- 4.3 In February 2016, options for the future of Maesyffynnon Residential care home were considered by the Council's Cabinet and it was agreed that a six-week consultation on the preferred option be carried out.
- 4.4 As well as the significant maintenance issues identified, Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home was not designed to meet the current expectations and national minimum standards for care home accommodation set by the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales. For example, in terms of room sizes, disabled access and the provision of full en-suite facilities.
- 4.5 Older people's aspirations are changing and, as with the rest of the population, older people have higher expectations of independence, choice and control over their lives. Evidence indicates that the majority of older people would prefer to stay in their own homes and not move into an institutional or a care home setting.

- 4.6 The number of older people supported permanently in care homes has reduced over recent years, in line with the Council's priority to support older people to remain independent and to live safely in their own homes for longer rather than move to a residential care home. This in turn has increased the number of vacant residential care home bed spaces.
- 4.7 In addition, the Regional Cwm Taf Commissioning Strategy for Older People approved by the Council's Cabinet in February 2016, following public consultation during 2015, identified key changes in service delivery in order to enhance the health, wellbeing and independence of older people and avoid admissions to institutional settings, such as residential care homes. The strategy identifies the need to develop more specialist housing as an alternative model of community based accommodation with care and support, such as extra care housing in order to maximise independence and choice.
- 4.8 As a consequence of the above, the reliance on residential care placements is expected to diminish further.

## **5. OPTIONS AND ANALYSIS**

- 5.1 Following the Cabinet's decision to temporarily close Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home, a number of potential options for the future of the Home and the re-design of services were explored and reported to Cabinet on the 11<sup>th</sup> February 2016 for further consideration. These options were summarised into the following three categories:
1. Option 1: Respond to current maintenance/refurbishment issues
  2. Option 2: Fully refurbish or rebuild Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home, so it meets current new build Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales standards for residential care services, and
  3. Option 3: Permanently close Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home and develop alternative extra care housing provision

A brief description of each option is included below:

### **Option 1: Respond to current maintenance/refurbishment issues**

- 5.2 Under this option only the current maintenance issues identified at Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home would be addressed as summarised below:

**Option 1a:** this would involve replacing the Home's heating and hot and cold water supplies (i.e. the mechanical services) and boiler plant. The cost of option 1a is estimated at approximately £250,000 and would take around 16 weeks to complete. This option would only deal with urgent essential maintenance concerns, but would not address other areas of the Home that

require attention nor ensure full compliance with current Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales standards or provide a viable care home facility for the future.

**Option 1b:** as option 1a, but would also include an additional programme of work to address all refurbishment/maintenance issues, including: replacement of electrical installation and roofs; replacement external fire escapes; repairs/replacement of fencing; bathroom, kitchen and bedroom refurbishment and painting and decoration. The cost of option 1b is estimated at approximately £998,000 and would take around 22 weeks to complete. This option would address all urgent maintenance and associated refurbishment works, but would not ensure full compliance with current Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales standards or provide a viable care home facility for the future.

5.3 Option 1 would not support the Council's or the Cwm Taf Region's agreed commissioning intent to offer to greater choice and security of tenure for older people by diverting them away from institutional models of accommodation with care towards extra care housing.

5.4 Option 1 is not recommended.

**Option 2: Fully refurbish/rebuild Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home, so it meets current new build Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales standards**

5.5 Under this option the existing Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home building would be either refurbished or demolished and rebuilt in accordance with current Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales standards to provide residential dementia services only.

5.6 If Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home was refurbished to meet current Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales standards in care home provision the bedroom capacity of the Home would have to be reduced substantially by up to 50% depending on final scheme specifications. Whilst the refurbishment option is technically viable the long term financial viability of the Home would be questionable and would not demonstrate value for money due to its size and economies of scale.

5.7 Experience from elsewhere has shown that in such circumstances the better solution has usually been to demolish the existing care home and build from new. This would involve on-going temporary closure of Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home, demolition and redevelopment of the site to create a new purpose built residential care home for people with dementia in line with current Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales standards.

- 5.8 The estimated cost of demolition of Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home site and rebuilding a new purpose built care home facility of 40 units would cost approximately £5.5 million depending on final scheme specifications.
- 5.9 Whilst rebuild is a technically viable solution, there is sufficient provision of residential care of the required type and quality in Rhondda Cynon Taf to meet current demands should the Home not reopen. Furthermore, this option would not support the Council's or Cwm Taf's Regional commissioning intent of offering greater choice and security of tenure for older people by diverting them away from institutional models of accommodation with care towards extra care housing.
- 5.10 Option 2 is not recommended.

**Option 3: Permanently close Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home and develop alternative extra care housing provision**

- 5.11 Under this option there are two proposals for consideration:

**Option 3a** is to close Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home and redevelop the existing site to create an extra care housing scheme in place of the Home.

**Option 3b** is to close Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home and develop extra care housing on an alternative site in the Cynon Valley area.

- 5.12 Extra care housing is a form of specialist housing with care services and would provide a well tested and effective alternative to residential care, nursing care, and sheltered housing. Extra care housing is different from the more traditional forms of care and housing because:

- people are living in their own home
- people have their own self-contained one or two-bedroom apartment with their own front door
- couples and friends can stay together
- people have access to on-site communal facilities, for example activity rooms, a communal lounge, restaurant/café and therapy rooms
- there are organised activities people can join in with if they wish
- 24 hour care services are located on site
- there is a mix of people with differing levels of need and receive support to maintain their independence
- people have control over their own finances
- there is housing security – the aim is a home for life even if people's care needs change over time

- 5.13 Personal care and support services would be available to all residents on site at times, if required, and would be scaled up or down as required by the individual as their needs change. This means extra care housing can

accommodate people with a range of needs, including those with dementia, nursing and end of life care who would otherwise be catered for in residential and nursing placements.

- 5.14 The estimated cost of developing an extra care housing scheme of around 40 units is estimated at approximately £7 million, based on specifications developed for the Talbot Green extra care housing scheme currently being built.
- 5.15 Implementing this proposed option supports the Council's agreed strategy of increasing the supply of extra care housing and reducing reliance on institutional care settings, such as residential care.
- 5.16 Cabinet's preferred option, stated at its meeting on the 11<sup>th</sup> February 2016, is to permanently close Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home and develop alternative extra care housing provision on the current site (i.e. **Option 3a**).

## **6. CONSULTATION**

- 6.1 A public consultation on the future of Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home commenced on 11<sup>th</sup> April 2016 and closed on 23 May 2016. A questionnaire and accompanying documentation was distributed to approximately 2349 households in the Aberaman North electoral ward. The questionnaire was also made available throughout the consultation period on the Council's website, with copies also available on paper and in alternative formats. The consultation document outlined the 3 key options for the future of the Home and explained the rationale behind the Council's preferred option (Option 3a).
- 6.2 In order to ensure that Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home residents and their relatives had the opportunity to participate in the consultation they were contacted in writing by officers and asked either to complete and return a consultation questionnaire or to contact a named officer to arrange a meeting to discuss the consultation.
- 6.3 All Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home staff were also given the opportunity to give verbal feedback and raise questions at group meetings. These were well attended. Trade Unions were also consulted, and were involved in supporting staff during the consultation period. A visit was arranged for staff and Trade Unions to an extra care housing scheme in a neighbouring local authority as part of the consultation process.
- 6.4 A public drop-in session was held at Saron Chapel, Aberaman on Tuesday, 3<sup>rd</sup> May 2016 to provide the opportunity for people to give verbal feedback and raise questions they had regarding the consultation proposals.
- 6.5 A total of 21 completed questionnaires were received. 1 of these was from a resident of Maesyffynnon Residential Care Homes, 3 from relatives of residents, 4 from members of staff at the Home, 10 were members of the



general public and 3 were from other respondents who didn't fall into any of these categories.

- 6.6 A further 2 written responses were received by letter, and the public drop-in session attracted 20 people. Senior Managers also met individually with some residents, at their request to give their feedback verbally.
- 6.7 The results of the consultation exercise are summarised in paragraphs 6.8 to 6.16 below.

### **Summary of consultation results and key themes**

- 6.8 Overall, 55% of the questionnaire responses received indicated support for the preferred option to permanently close Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home and develop alternative extra care housing provision on the current site of the Home. 45% of responses were from people who disagreed with the proposal.
- 6.9 The majority of the respondents opposing the Council's preferred option commented that they had a preference for Option 1, i.e. to respond to the current maintenance/refurbishment issues at Maesyffynnon.
- 6.10 However, overall the levels of support for the alternative options were low. In all cases, the majority of respondents were against the alternative options put forward. The alternative option which was most popular was Option 1a (i.e. to respond to the current maintenance/refurbishment issues) with 35% respondents indicating they had a preference. Option 3b (i.e. permanent closure and develop extra care provision on a different site) was the least popular alternative option with just 7% of respondents indicating they had a preference.
- 6.11 One of the most common viewpoints for residents, their relatives and staff who provided feedback during the consultation was that they would prefer that Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home stayed open. Residents and their relatives spoke highly of the quality of care at the Home. Some people felt the standard of care was so high at Maesyffynnon that it would be difficult to match in another setting. On the whole residents and relatives felt that the care at Maesyffynnon compensated for a less than ideal building and were of the opinion that the Home is fit for purpose and meet the needs of current residents. Many said that the rooms are big enough and en-suites are not needed and residents could continue to manage without them, particularly as these facilities were not available in the majority of other Rhondda Cynon Taf care homes.
- 6.12 Another common viewpoint was that there had been too little consideration of current Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home residents' individual choices and wishes, and the impact moving has on them. Current residents and their relatives talked of how carefully they had thought through their choice of care

home, in the expectation that they would end their days in the home they had chosen. The majority of residents and their relatives that provided feedback (written or verbal) were happy living at Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home and did not want to move. There was some concern expressed that moving has had a negative impact on the health of some of the residents. During the consultation feedback some residents expressed a wish to return to Maesyffynnon whilst others now wished to remain at their new homes, where they had settled, and not move again.

- 6.13 Other common comments made in opposition to the preferred option included concerns that extra care housing provision would not be suitable for the current residents, in that people who largely need 24 hour care could not safely live independently on their own. Some argued that some elderly people would need more care than can actually be provided through domiciliary care packages and would be at risk and socially isolated in extra care provision. Some people who responded, including staff gave the view that extra care housing is not suitable for people with dementia.
- 6.14 There was also a strong response that residential care homes are still needed particularly for people with dementia and others such as frail elderly people who cannot live independently, but do not need nursing care. It was argued that residential care should not be an either/or option with extra care and that both are needed. Some felt that more residential and nursing homes are needed in order to meet future demand.
- 6.15 Some local Aberaman residents had concerns that closure of Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home would lead to the site being redeveloped in a way which made it less attractive for other residents of Aberaman relating, in particular, to the design of any new facility and that it could ultimately be used to meet general needs social housing need.
- 6.16 All staff, and their Trade Union representatives, who engaged as part of the consultation process felt that should Cabinet proceed with its preferred option that the Council should directly employ the care staff employed at the new extra care facility and that the recruitment process should involve only current staff employed at Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home in the first instance.

## **7. EQUALITY AND DIVERSITY IMPLICATIONS**

- 7.1 An Equality Impact Assessment (EIA) has been completed to analyse the potential impact of implementing the preferred option relating to the future of, and provision of services at, Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home. The full EIA report is attached as Appendix 1.
- 7.2 The proposed changes are relevant to older people's social care provision and will therefore impact on older and disabled people disproportionately. Overall the impact is likely to be mixed.



- 7.3 If the decision is taken to implement the preferred option, implementation arrangements will need to have full regard to equality planning requirements, thus ensuring that every effort is made to minimise any negative impacts and promote equality.

## **8. FINANCIAL IMPLICATION(S)**

- 8.1 Clearly the primary focus for consideration as part of the consultation was on delivering improved quality of care outcomes for current and future adult social care service users. For the purpose though of setting options into context, cost estimates for each of the options were included within the consultation information provided. These costs varied from £250,000 to £7M depending on the option selected.
- 8.2 Whilst the costs of individual options were included, the funding source was not identified. Options 1 and 2 around responding to current maintenance issues and refurbishment of the home would require a significant capital investment by the Council. The preferred option (Option 3a) whilst potentially higher in total cost terms, did include the opportunity to work with a local Housing Provider to develop the scheme. Indications from similar projects developed elsewhere are that this could eventually be developed at minimal, or at least a much lower cost than the quoted total scheme cost.
- 8.3 The current capital programme, agreed by Council on the 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2016 already includes an allocation for a 'Modernisation Programme (Adults)' (£0.765M over the three years). It is suggested that subject to Cabinet agreeing to proceed with the preferred option that dialogue begins with prospective Housing Provider partners immediately and that any resource requirements over and above the current capital programme allocation are reported and agreed through Cabinet and Council as appropriate.

## **9. STAFFING**

- 9.1 The options set out in this report and the recommended preferred option will require a review of current staffing levels for Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home in both the short and medium to long term. These reviews will be carried out in accordance with the Council's statutory obligations and Managing Change Policy. Staff and Trade Unions will continue to be fully consulted at the appropriate time.

## **10. LEGAL IMPLICATIONS OR LEGISLATION CONSIDERED**

- 10.1 In considering the preferred option relating to the future of, and provision of services at, Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home consideration should be given to the relevant provisions of the Social Services and Wellbeing (Wales) Act 2014, which came into force in April 2016.

- 10.2 A core element of the Social Services and Wellbeing (Wales) Act 2014 is the duty to promote wellbeing. This duty applies when considering decisions in respect of an individual but also when considering broader strategic issues that do not relate to an individual. A key part of the duty to promote wellbeing is supporting people to live as independently as possible for as long as possible. The preferred option for Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home outlined in Section 5 above is consistent with that duty.
- 10.3 In addition, the Social Services and Wellbeing (Wales) Act 2014 requires local authorities to encourage choice, including a variety of living options, including extra care housing. The desirability of this option, and the demand for it, is set out throughout this report.
- 10.4 Possible care home closures require that there is proper consultation. Case law clarifies that legally valid consultation should satisfy the following:
- a. be at a time when proposals are still at a formative stage;
  - b. sufficient reasons be given for any proposal so as to enable intelligent consideration and response;
  - c. adequate time must be given for consideration and response; and
  - d. the product of the consultation must be properly taken into account when the decision is made
- 10.5 Details of the consultation are set out in Section 6 above.

## **11. LINKS TO THE COUNCILS CORPORATE PLAN/OTHER CORPORATE PRIORITIES/SIP**

- 11.1 Consideration of the preferred option outlined in Section 5 above will support delivery of the Council's corporate priority "promoting independence and positive lives for everyone" by helping local people with care and support needs to stay living independently at home.
- 11.2 In addition, the Council's joint commissioning statement for older people's services identifies as a priority the transformation of residential care by developing new models of service which are more sustainable and enable people to remain within the community in support services such as extra care housing.

## **12. CONCLUSION**

- 12.1 More people are living longer, and whilst most people are able to live active and independent lives, an increasing number need care and support to overcome the effects of long term illness, disability or family breakdown. For many, the traditional services we have provided in the past are not flexible enough and don't give people the control and autonomy they need to reduce their dependence on others and live more fulfilled lives. Whilst concerns have understandably been raised by some during the consultation process,

Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home was not designed to meet current expectations or future requirements, for example independence levels, room sizes, disabled access and the provision of full en-suite facilities.

- 12.2 In addition, the number of older people supported permanently in care homes has reduced over recent years. People want to remain independent and to live safely in their own homes for longer rather than move to a residential care home. Older people's aspirations are quite rightly changing and, as with the rest of the population, older people have higher expectations of independence, choice and control over their lives. This is accepted and reinforced by the agreed Cwm Taf Commissioning Strategy for Older People approved by the Council's Cabinet in February 2016.
- 12.3 In order to deliver the on-going modernisation of adult services accommodation and best meet the needs of our community, the need to develop more specialist extra care housing as an alternative model of community based accommodation in order to maximise independence and choice is supported by the preferred option.

**Other information:**

**Relevant Scrutiny Committee:** Health and Wellbeing

**LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT 1972**

**AS AMENDED BY**

**THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985**

**RHONDDA CYNON TAF COUNTY BOROUGH COUNCIL**

**CABINET**

**23<sup>RD</sup> JUNE 2016**

**REPORT OF THE GROUP DIRECTOR, COMMUNITY AND CHILDREN'S SERVICES, IN DISCUSSION WITH THE RELEVANT PORTFOLIO HOLDER, COUNCILLOR FOREY**

**MAESYFFYNNON RESIDENTIAL CARE HOME**

**Background Papers:**

**Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home (Cabinet report 11th February 2016)**  
**Maesyffynnon Residential Care Home (Cabinet report 6th October 2015)**

**Officer to contact:** Neil Elliott, Service Director, Adult Services.  
Tel. No. 01443 444603. E-mail: [neil.a.elliott@rctcbc.gov.uk](mailto:neil.a.elliott@rctcbc.gov.uk)