# RHONDDA CYNON TAF COUNTY BOROUGH COUNCIL

## MUNICIPAL YEAR 2015-2016

<b>DEVELOPMENT CONTROL</b>
COMMITTEE
17 SEPTEMBER 2015

REPORT OF: SERVICE DIRECTOR PLANNING

## 1. <u>PURPOSE OF THE REPORT</u>

Members are asked to determine the planning applications outlined in Appendix 1.

## 2. <u>RECOMMENDATION</u>

To approve the applications subject to the conditions outlined in Appendix 1.

- Application No. 15/0695 Planning application for erection of a 90 m temporary anemometer mast comprised of a singular tubular guyed mast, supported by guy wires with the actual footprint not exceeding 0.1 ha in area. Planning approval is sought for a period of 36 months after which the mast will be dismantled and the ground conditions fully reinstated, land within the construction site of Pen Y Cymoedd Wind Farm, Easting 294330 Northing 200320.
- Application No. 15/0703 Construction of two wind turbines of up to 67.5m tip height and associated new access track and infrastructure, on land at Mynachdy Farm, Mynachdy Road, Ynysybwl, Pontypridd.
- 3. Application No. 15/0795 The demolition of existing buildings on site, and the construction of 14 no. affordable residential dwellings, Ty Gwyn Psychological Centre, land to the west of Seaton Street, Pontypridd.
- 4. Application No. 15/0813 Extension of existing car park (amended red line received 16/07/15), St John Baptist High School, Glan Road, Cwmdare, Aberdare.
- 5. Application No. 15/0884 To install 3 no. temporary buildings to be used as additional classroom facilities. To be reviewed after 3 years, St John Baptist High School, Glan Road, Cwmdare, Aberdare.
- 6. Application No. 15/0945 Repair and cleaning of the memorial to Evan James and James James, at Ynysangharad Park, Pontypridd, Ynysangharad Park, Bridge Street, Pontypridd.

This page intentionally blank

#### APPLICATIONS RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL

APPLICATION NO: APPLICANT: DEVELOPMENT:	15/0695/10 (DB) Vattenfall Wind Power Limited, BD Renewables Planning application for erection of a 90 m temporary anemometer mast comprised of a singular tubular guyed mast, supported by guy wires with the actual footprint not exceeding 0.1 ha in area. Planning approval is sought for a period of 36 months after which the mast will be dismantled and the ground conditions fully reinstated.
LOCATION:	LAND WITHIN THE CONSTRUCTION SITE OF PEN Y CYMOEDD WIND FARM, EASTING 294330 NORTHING 200320
DATE REGISTERED: ELECTORAL DIVISION:	18/06/2015 Treherbert

#### **RECOMMENDATION:** Approve

#### **REASONS:**

The principle of the development is considered acceptable and is considered to comply with the relevant policies of the Local Development Plan in respect of its impact on, landscape character and visual amenity, nature conservation and existing landscape features, archaeological features and highway safety.

## **APPLICATION DETAILS**

The application seeks permission to erect a 90 metre high anemometer mast to measure wind speed and directional data in respect of the development of the Pen Y Cymoedd Wind Farm on land at Mynydd Tynewydd, (at GR 294330, 200320). The permission sought is for a temporary period of a maximum of 36 months, in order to collect up to date wind data in connection with turbine T82 of the consented wind farm scheme.

The proposed development would consist of a 90 metre high slim tubular or lattice structure with anemometers and wind vanes positioned at various heights along the mast. The mast would sit on a steel base plate which would rest on a number of timber sleepers laid on the ground. It would be supported by eight guy wires constructed of galvanised steel and secured to the ground at eight anchor points to a shallow depth at 4 opposing corners around the mast, at between 25 - 50m from the base of the mast. Each anchor point would require an excavation of approximately 1.5m in depth which would be backfilled by the excavated material.

The mast would include anemometry equipment, a power source and a small transmitter to allow remote transfer of data.

The applicant advises that the mast would be installed by qualified mast installers and would take 1 -2 days depending upon weather conditions and would only be undertaken during daylight hours.

No abnormal loads would be required, as the mast would be transported in sections by 4x4 vehicles and off road trailers and assembled using a winch to raise the mast and secure the guy wires. No new access tracks or other infrastructure would be required for vehicular movements on site as use would be made of the existing forestry tracks and tracks of the existing consented wind farm development of Pen Y Cymoedd.

The applicant advises that the mast would be located in an area of sparse, poor quality trees which will be cleared in order to provide an open location free from planting in order to provide accurate wind resource data.

At the end of the temporary permission the mast would be removed and the land fully reinstated.

A Design and Access Statement accompanies the planning application.

## SITE APPRAISAL

The application site is located in the countryside, encompasses a circular area of 0.10 hectares, located at a height of approximately 500m A.O.D, located within the south eastern area of the Pen Y Cymoedd wind farm. It lies approximately 200m south -west of the trig point at Mynydd Tynewydd at 516m AOD.

The site lies approximately 1.6km east of Blaenrhondda and approximately 1.7km north of Treherbert, the two closest settlements.

The site forms part of the land belonging to Natural Resources Wales.

The proposed access to the site of the mast would be along existing forestry tracks and the wind farm tracks which enter the public highway to the north west along Rhigos Road.

The site is located within a Site of Importance for Nature Conservation known as Mynydd y Ystradffernol as defined in the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

The site lies within the Rhondda Historical Landscape as cited in the Register of Landscapes of Historic Interest in Wales: Part 2:2: Landscapes of Special Historic Interest (2001), the Rhondda Historic Landscape representing one of the largest and best-known mining conurbations and coalfield communities in Britain.

# PLANNING HISTORY

The site is located within the site of the Pen Y Cymoedd Wind Farm. Ref

09/1311 Approximately 47 Km<sup>2</sup> of land south of The Heads of The Valleys Road (A465) between Neath & Aberdare, to the north of Maerdy, Treorchy, & Glyncorrwg and to the East of Tonmawr

Application under S36 of the Electricity Act. Construction/operation of a 299MW wind turbine generating station (84 turbines, 4 anemometry masts and associated infrastructure.

Raise no objection 07/10/11

# PUBLICITY

The application has been advertised by means of site notices placed in the vicinity of the site access onto the public highway along the A4061 Rhigos Road and in the communities of Tynewydd and Treherbert. No responses have been received as a result of this publicity.

## CONSULTATION

Public Health and Protection Division – raises no objections.

Land Reclamation and Drainage - raises no objections.

Countryside Section – raises no objections subject to conditions to secure pre site works, construction, operation, decommissioning and land restoration. No relevant SewBrec records of Statutory Protected Species from immediate vicinity. Appropriate bat informative needed on any planning permission.

NRW – raises no adverse comments. Refers the applicant to Planning Advice Note for advice on pollution prevention and drainage.

Transportation Section – raises no highway objections.

Glamorgan Gwent Archaeological Trust - (GGAT) raises no objections to the positive determination of the proposed development.

## POLICY CONTEXT

## Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan (LDP)

The application site is situated in the open countryside, within the TAN 8 Strategic Search Area F (SSA F), within the Mynydd y Ystradffernol Site of Important Nature Conservation (Policy AW8.26) and Sandstone Resource Area (Policy AW14.2) as defined in the Local Development Plan.

**Policy AW5** supports development proposals where amenity and accessibility criteria are met.

**Policy AW6** supports development proposals where design and place making criteria are met.

**Policy AW7** seeks to protect and enhance features of the historic, archaeological and built environment and Public Rights of Way.

**Policy AW8** seeks to protect SINC's, and features of the natural environment from inappropriate development.

**Policy AW12** supports development proposals which promote the provision of renewable energy where it can be demonstrated there is no unacceptable effects.

**Policy AW14.2** safeguards resources of sandstone from development which would unnecessarily sterilise them or hinder their extraction.

## National Guidance

In the determination of planning applications regard should also be given to the requirements of National Planning Policy which are not duplicated in the Local Development Plan, particularly where National Planning Policy provides a more up to date and comprehensive policy on certain topics.

Planning Policy Wales Chapter 3 (Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions), Chapter 4 (Planning for Sustainability), Chapter 5 (Conserving and Improving Natural Heritage and the Coast), and Chapter 12 (Infrastructure and Services) set out the Welsh Government's policy on planning issues relevant to the determination of the application.

## Other relevant policy guidance consulted

PPW Technical Advice Note (TAN) 5 (Nature Conservation and Planning) and TAN 8 (Planning for Renewable Energy). The site is located inside of TAN 8 Strategic Search Area F.

## REASONS FOR REACHING THE RECOMMENDATION

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purposes of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Furthermore, applications that are not in accordance with relevant policies in the plan should not be allowed, unless material considerations justify the grant of planning permission.

#### Main Issues:

## Principle of the proposed development

The proposal involves the provision of an anemometer mast, 90 metres high, for a maximum period of 36 months, in order to collect up to date wind data in connection with the Pen Y Cymoedd consented wind farm scheme which is presently under construction.

Renewable energy development is supported by both national and local planning policy in principle for economic reasons and for their contribution to meeting the challenges of climate change, subject to criteria.

It is therefore considered that the principle of the proposed development is acceptable.

## Impact on landscape character and visual amenity

It is considered that the introduction of a 90m high man-made structure, on the site which is in an elevated location, would inevitably have an impact on the landscape character and visual appearance of the area.

The proposed development would detract to a certain extent from the landscape character of the area, however, such impact is mitigated by the slenderness of the mast and guys and its temporary nature. The greatest impact would undoubtedly be from short distance views but the effect would significantly diminish when seen from distant vantage points.

The Design and Access Statement which accompanies the application states that it is only from Viewpoint 13, taken at Blaencwm of all the views submitted with the original Pen Y Cymoedd wind farm application which would have the clearest views of the mast. This shows that the mast would be seen in the context of the consented Pen Y Cymoedd wind turbines and permanent masts which would be in place apart from the first six months of the installation of the mast. In view of the slim line and static nature of the proposed mast, the DAS states that the proposed mast would not be readily visible from viewpoints further afield. The assessment concludes that given the nature of the proposed development, and its location within a wind farm setting it is considered that the temporary mast would have a negligible landscape and visual impact.

Overall, it is considered that the small scale and temporary nature of the development would be unlikely to have a significant impact on the landscape character and visual appearance of the area and that therefore the mast would comply with national and local planning policies in respect of these issues.

## Impact on nature conservation and landscape features

In terms of nature conservation interests, the site of the mast is located within a Site of Importance for Nature Conservation (SINC), Mynydd y Ystradffernol Site of Important Nature Conservation (Policy AW8.26) which is designated for its coniferous bird populations and for peat areas beneath the forestry.

The proposed mast would be located within an area where tree growth has been stunted due to water logging in the area and has also been burnt at some point. As such the trees to be cleared are sparse and not part of the commercial crop.

The DAS advises that peat probes collected at the site of the mast indicate that the peat is less than 1m deep and that any amount of peat disturbed during installation of the anchors would be reinstated immediately and would therefore not have .a significant impact on the peat resource.

Overall, in view of the method to be used in securing the mast, there would be minimal impact on the existing ground conditions, an extremely small footprint involved and no works are required to the existing access tracks to the site.

The Council's Ecologist has raised no objection, as the proposed works would be of little significance to the SINC, and conditions are recommended in order to minimise the disturbance and to secure a suitable restoration of the minimal land involved.

It is therefore considered that in view of the small scale nature of the proposed development, and subject to the imposition of conditions as recommended by the Council's Ecologist, the proposal would comply with national and local planning policies in respect of its impact on existing nature conservation and landscape features.

### Archaeological Resource

GGAT, as archaeological advisors to RCT, advise that the information in the Historic Environment Record indicates that there are no known archaeological resources within the footprint of the development site. There is a Scheduled Ancient Monument, GM539:Garn Bica round cairn approximately 200m north east of the site and two undesignated archaeological assets PRN01050m - worked flint and PRN00016m Garn Fach cairn lie within a 350m radius of the proposed mast site.

GGAT advise that it is unlikely that the proposed work will impact on the nearby archaeological resource, and have requested that the applicant should be made aware of these and take steps to avoid damaging the resource during the work. Also, should any previously unrecorded archaeological remains be encountered during the course of the work the applicant should contact GGAT for advice. These matters can be attached as notes to any consent granted. GGAT therefore raise no objection to the positive determination of the application.

It is also considered that in respect of the impact on the Rhondda Registered Historic Landscape, whilst the proposed mast would introduce another element into the upland landscape, it would have no adverse impact on its setting due to its limited visibility and small size.

It is therefore considered the proposal would not conflict with the purposes of LDP Policy AW7.

# OTHER ISSUES

The following other material considerations have been taken into account in considering the application, though they were not the key determining factors in reaching the recommendation:

## Highway Safety and Public Rights of Way

The site would be accessed via the A4061 and the consented forestry and wind farm tracks associated with the Pen Y Cymoedd Wind Farm. The tracks have no steep gradients and are suitable for all conventional vehicles. The applicant states that the installation does not require the use of specialist vehicles as access is suitable for 4x4 vehicles. A tracked vehicle would be required to assist with the installation of the mast. Once installed the proposed meteorological mast would generate little additional traffic, as this would only be required infrequently for routine maintenance as the collection of data would be accessed remotely. Decommissioning and removal of the mast would result in the same amount of traffic.

It is considered therefore that in view of the scale of this temporary development, in terms of the type and volume of traffic generated, the scheme is acceptable in highway terms. No highway objection is raised or conditions proposed by the Transportation Section.

## Sandstone Resource

The site is located within a Sandstone Resource area, which is safeguarded from development which would unnecessarily sterilise or hinder its extraction by Policy AW14.2 of the LDP. However, given the temporary nature of the proposed development, it is considered that mineral sterilisation is not an issue. Therefore the proposal would not conflict with the purpose of the LDP policy.

## Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) Liability

The Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) was introduced in Rhondda Cynon Taf from 31 December 2014. The application is for development of a kind that is not liable under the CIL Regulations 2010 (as amended).

## Conclusion

In conclusion, given national and local planning guidance which provides a presumption in favour of renewable energy schemes and that the proposal is a slim, lightweight, temporary structure, which would not result in any significant adverse effects, the application is recommended for a temporary permission.

## **RECOMMENDATION:** Grant

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of five years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with Sections 91 and 93 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

- 2. The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents:-
  - Site Location Plan Drawing No. PYC\_M\_5041\_B.
  - Plan and elevation Drawing No. PYC\_D\_5043.

Unless otherwise to be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure compliance with the approved plans and documents and to clearly define the scope of the permission.

3. The development hereby approved shall be removed from the site no later than 36 months from the date of the commencement of the development and the site reinstated in accordance with the details and a scheme which shall previously have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Written notification of the date of commencement of the development shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority not less than 14 days after the development commences.

Reason: The development is of a temporary nature and not suitable for retention on a permanent basis in this location; and to secure the proper decommissioning of the development proposal.

- 4. Prior to the commencement of the development a Construction Management Plan shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The plan shall include the following matters:-
  - Details of the reinstatement of the site following removal of the mast,
  - An appropriate scale plan showing 'Wildlife Protection Zones' where construction activities are restricted and where protective measures will be installed or implemented where applicable.
  - Details of protective measures (both physical measures and sensitive working practices) to avoid impacts during construction

All construction activities and the development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details and timing unless otherwise approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To minimise environmental impact in the vicinity of the application site in accordance with policies AW8 and AW12 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf

Local Development Plan.

APPLICATION NO: APPLICANT:	15/0703/10	(DB)
DEVELOPMENT:		wind turbines of up to 67.5m tip ed new access track and
LOCATION:		ACHDY FARM, MYNACHDY ROAD, FYPRIDD, CF37 3PP
DATE REGISTERED: ELECTORAL DIVISION:	08/06/2015 Ynysybwl	

#### **RECOMMENDATION:** Approve

#### **REASONS:**

The principle of the development is considered acceptable, being a small scale wind development that would contribute to the Welsh Government's commitment to optimising renewable energy generation. Furthermore, it is considered that the proposed development can reasonably be accommodated within the landscape without significant harm to the existing landscape character of the area and visual amenity. In addition, no objections have been raised by statutory consultees with respect to the potential impacts upon either the amenity of nearby residential properties, highway safety or ecology.

#### **APPLICATION DETAILS**

Full planning permission is sought for two medium scale wind turbines, a wind monitoring mast and associated infrastructure on land at Mynachdy Farm, Mynachdy Road, Ynysybwl Pontypridd. They turbines would be sited at GR 303925, 195530 and 303984, 195445.

This proposal is for two 250kw wind turbines providing an overall power output of 500kw (0.5MW). The turbines would comprise of a height of 50m to the hub with a rotor diameter of 35m and an overall height to blade tip of 67.5m. The exact model would be a C&F Green Energy 250 -35 Wind Turbine. The turbine would be 3 bladed in a horizontal axis with a steel monopole tower and painted papyrus white (RAL 9018). Associated apparatus would include a transformer station (approximately 2m x 2m x 2.8m) at the base of each turbine and one substation (approximately  $6m \times 4m \times 2.8m$ ) adjacent to the southernmost turbine. These would be constructed externally with glass reinforced plastic and would be a dark green or brown colour. A parking and a turning area would be located adjacent to each of the

wind turbines. There would also be a hard-standing area of approximately 16m x 22m for the two cranes required to construct the wind turbines.

Foundation details for the turbines would be subject to a ground condition survey but would typically involve a concrete foundation base measuring approximately 11m-12m diameter, to a depth of 1.43m below the ground with the top of the concrete 0.3m above the ground level.

The DAS states that the wind turbines would generate electricity equivalent to domestic usage of around 470 homes each year for the 25 year period. The turbines would be connected to the national grid by a mixture of underground and overhead lines to reach the existing overhead 11kv line at Mynachdy Farm.

The wind turbine would be operated by Seren Energy with part of the income provided to the applicant which would contribute to the farm's sustainability and diversification.

The turbine and associated apparatus would be operational for 25 years, thereafter it would be dismantled, removed from the site and the site reinstated to its previous condition. Existing soils within the excavation areas would be conserved. It would then be respread over the crane platform and foundation structure on completion and allowed to re -vegetate naturally.

Access to the proposed development would be from the existing access to Mynachdy Farm located off the B4273 through Ynysybwl. In order to reach the site, access would initially follow the route of an existing rough track for approximately 700m which would be resurfaced where required. Thereafter an additional new length of track would be constructed across two fields measuring approximately 550m in length and approximately 4m wide, widening to 5m at the sharper corners. It would be constructed of a compacted layer of rough grade hardcore to a depth of between 250-350 mm overlain by a layer of compacted medium even grade gravel to a thickness of 50mm stone to form a hard smooth surface. New drainage channels would be constructed approximately  $0.4 \times 0.4m$  to direct surface water away from the track.

The proposed development would involve a total of 202 HGV vehicular movements to and from the site over a 3 month period, with 29 HGV movements on the busiest days. There would also be a maximum of 5 abnormal load trips required for the delivery of the wind turbine components and cranes required for the installation over a 1 week period. The routine maintenance of the turbines would require a visit 3-4 times a year with a medium sized van.

Construction working hours are proposed to be 7am to 7pm Monday to Saturday with an allowance for Sunday working if required for the crane needed to assemble the wind turbines which is very sensitive to weather conditions.

The application is accompanied by supporting information which includes a planning additional information document, a Design and Access Statement, Landscape and

Visual Impact Assessment (LVIA) and associated visualisations, aboricultural assessment, ecological assessment, and a historic environment assessment,

## SITE APPRAISAL

The site is located in the open countryside outside the settlement boundary. It lies to the north west of the village of Ynysybwl and the B4273 and west of the unnamed country lane which runs north leading to Miskin, Mountain Ash. It lies approximately 900 m to the north west of Mynachdy Farmhouse. The proposed turbines are located on a small plateau of elevated land at a height of 325m to 335m Above Ordnance Datum (AOD) although the land to the immediate north extends up to a height of 361m AOD and land further to the north west extends up to 470m AOD. It lies above land to the south which falls away to the south east to Ynysybwl and the valley of the Cwm Clydach to the east. The land is generally secluded and hidden from the surrounding main valleys.

The site occupies a small footprint within pasture land of an overall farming business of 350 acres. It lies adjacent to forestry (St Gwynno's forest) which surrounds the land to the north, east and north east of the site. The site lies approximately 150m west of the existing motorbike, track, archery and assault course outdoor activity centre which is located within the land holding of Mynachdy Farm.

The nearest dwelling to the proposed wind turbines is Dduallt Farm at approximately 662m from the nearest wind turbine. The other nearest property is the Brynffynon Public House in LLanwonno which is around 860m from the nearest turbine. The nearest concentration of dwellings are located at about 1km within Mynachdy Road Ynysybwl.

## Within 300m to the north west of the site lies a wireless mast and further along the ridge to the west there are pylons carrying power lines from north to south. Beyond these to the north west there are the wind farms of Mynydd Portref and Taff Ely.

There are no statutory landscape or conservation designations on the application site or within the vicinity of the site. The site lies within the Special Landscape Area known as Cwm Clydach and the boundary of the St Gwynno Site of Importance for Nature Conservation, which is an extensive area of forestry plantation, lies 60m north of the site. The site lies at its closest point 1.4km from the Rhondda Landscape of Historic Interest.

PROW YCC/12/1 and Sustrans Route (National Cycle Route 47) run along a stretch of the existing access track within Mynachdy Farm and PROW YCC/15/2 lies approximately 110 m from the nearest turbine.

Whilst not strategic scale development, it is noted that the proposal appears to lie outside but adjacent to the outer edge boundary of the TAN 8 Annex D Strategic Search Area [SSA] F. The applicant however considers that one turbine lies within SSAF and one lies outside.

The site lies within the consultation zone of Cardiff International Airport, as provided by the UK Civil Aviation Authority.

## PLANNING HISTORY

08/1003	Mynachdy Farm, Mynachdy Road, Ynysybwl, Pontypridd	Change of Use of land from agricultural to recreational and agricultural including motorbike track, archery and assault course.	GTD 16/04/09
08/1248	Mynachdy Farm, Mynachdy Road, Ynysybwl, Pontypridd	Portacabin to be used in association with mixed agricultural and recreational use (proposed in planning application 08/1003).	GTD 15/04/09
08/1276	Mynachdy Farm, Mynachdy Road, Ynysybwl, Pontypridd	Agricultural building for the keeping of sheep.	GTD 16/10/08
14/5253	Mynachdy Farm, Mynachdy Road, Ynysybwl, Pontypridd	Screening opinion request for a wind turbine scheme.	EIA not required 04/09/14

## PUBLICITY

The application has been advertised by means of site notices and neighbourhood notification. As a result of this publicity one letter has been received raising the following matters:-

- Lack of publicity
- Turbines would significantly impact on beautiful scenery
- Noise pollution for this quiet, peaceful rural area
- Traffic disruption due to lack of parking in village
- Impact on wild birds especially red kite and filedfare and other protected birds
- Cumulative impacts with other wind turbines.

Three letters of support have been received making the following comments:-

- Provides local renewable energy scheme and the revenue donation to the community via the Community Council is needed. Hopefully used to improve facilities for children,
- Turbines will not be detrimental to area; will not be seen or heard from Mynachdy Road,
- Will enhance the area and the local skyline .

# CONSULTATION

Public Health and Protection Division – raises no objections to the proposed development subject to the imposition of conditions which include noise limits at the nearest residential property, hours of construction, dust suppression and the disposal of waste

Land Reclamation and Engineering – advises that further information is provided in order to assess the potential impact on flood risk matters. Recommends a condition in order to require drainage details for approval prior to any consent commencing.

Natural Resources Wales (NRW) – raises no objection subject to conditions to secure the implementation of the ecological assessment recommendations. Provides other advice regarding pollution prevention matters.

Transportation Section – raises no highway objections subject to conditions.

Cadw – advises that impacts on the setting of nearby schedule ancient monuments and historic parks, garden and the Rhondda historic landscape would be negligible or low.

Countryside Section – raises no objections. Advises that there are no SEWBREC records of statutory protected species from the immediate vicinity. Recommends conditions to secure proposed ecological mitigation and long term management plan. Advises that PROW YCC/12/1 is affected by the proposed access track and precautions should be put in place to ensure that there are no safety issues in relation to the public enjoyment of this path.

Glamorgan Gwent Archaeological Trust Ltd (GGAT) – raises no objection and advises on the requirement for mitigation which should be secured by condition.

Joint Radio Company Ltd – raises no objection.

Cardiff Airport – comments awaited at time of writing report.

# POLICY CONTEXT

## Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan (LDP)

The proposals and constraints maps indicate that the site is located in the countryside, within Special Landscape Area (Cwm Clydach NSA 25.4) and within the sandstone safeguarding area. The nearby forestry area lies within SINC (St Gwynno Forest AW8.38)

**Policy CS1** - outlines how the emphasis on building strong, sustainable communities will be achieved in the Northern Strategy Area.

**Policy CS10** – defines safeguarding areas for mineral resources.

**Policy AW4** - provides for the negotiation of planning obligations.

**Policy AW5** – supports development proposals where amenity and accessibility matters are addressed.

**Policy AW6** – supports development proposals where certain design and place making criteria are met.

**Policy AW7** – includes public rights of way in a list of features to be protected, replaced or enhanced where affected by new development.

**Policy AW10** – does not permit proposals where they would cause or result in a risk of unacceptable harm to health and/or local amenity because of matters including light and noise pollution.

**Policy AW12** - permits renewable energy schemes including small/medium sized wind turbines where there is no unacceptable effect upon the interests of certain matters including agriculture, nature conservation, cultural heritage, landscape importance, public health and residential amenity. Minimisation of resource use should also be included. For this policy small clusters of no more than 3 larger wind turbines up to 1.5 MW and community based schemes of no more than 5MW capacity are treated as small wind turbine developments.

**Policy AW14.2** safeguards the resources of sandstone from any development which would unnecessarily sterilise or hinder their extraction.

**Policy NSA25** states that development within the Special Landscape Areas (SLA's) will be expected to conform to the highest standards of design, siting, layout and materials appropriate to the character of the area.

## National Guidance

In the determination of planning applications regard should also be given to the requirements of National Planning Policy (which are not duplicated in the Local Development Plan) particularly where National Planning Policy provides a more up to date and comprehensive policy on certain topics.

Planning Policy Wales - Chapter 4 (Planning for Sustainability), Chapter 5 (Conserving and Improving Natural Heritage and the Coast), Chapter 6 (Historic Environment), Chapter 7 (Economy), Chapter 8 (Transport), Chapter 12 (Infrastructure and Services) and Chapter 13 (Minimising and Managing Environmental Risks and Pollution) set out the Welsh Government's policy on planning issues relevant to the determination of the application.

Other relevant policy guidance consulted:

PPW Technical Advice Note (TAN) 6: Planning for Sustainable Rural Communities (2010)

PPW Technical Advice Note (TAN) 8: Planning for Renewable Energy (2005)

Welsh Government Practice Guidance – "Planning Implications of Renewable and Low Carbon Energy" Feb 2011

PPW Technical Advice Note (TAN) 11: Noise (1997)

## REASONS FOR REACHING THE RECOMMENDATION

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purposes of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Furthermore, applications that are not in accordance with relevant policies in the plan should not be allowed, unless material considerations justify the grant of planning permission.

#### Main Issues:

The main consideration in the determination of this application is firstly whether the principle of the development is acceptable in this location. Further important considerations include whether the renewable energy scheme would have any adverse impacts on the landscape character and appearance of the surrounding area, nature conservation, agriculture, residential amenity of those living closest to the site, access and highway safety, land drainage and the aviation operations of Cardiff Airport.

Other Issues include cultural heritage, grid connection issues, the safeguarding of mineral resources and the benefits of the proposal.

#### Principle of development

At UK and Welsh Government level there is strong support for renewable and low carbon energy, with specific targets set for the reduction in green house gases and energy generation from on-shore wind development. The exploitation of wind power is promoted at all policy levels.

Whilst TAN 8 states in Para 2.2 that "large scale (over 25MW) onshore wind developments should be concentrated into particular areas defined as Strategic Search Areas (SSA's)", guidance is also provided for the development of smaller wind developments outside of these areas. In particular paragraph 2.12 states that "The Assembly Government expects local planning authorities to encourage, via their development plan policies and when considering individual planning applications, smaller community based wind farm schemes (generally less than 5MW)."

The application involves a wind turbine development of 0.50MW and is therefore classed as a small scale turbine in policy terms, being a "sub local authority" scale of development, at under 5MW within PPW. This scale of development is not required, within PPW, nor TAN 8 to be sited within the boundary of SSA F. The site is located approximately 0.5km from the outer edge of the boundary of SSAF. Para 12.9.9 advises that such "renewable energy projects are applicable in all parts of Wales and

development plans should encourage such development and clearly set out the local criteria against which such proposals will be evaluated."

TAN8 also identifies the need for authorities to consider the cumulative impact of small schemes in areas outside of the SSAs and the need to strike a balance between "the desirability of renewable energy and landscape protection" (2.13).

Policy AW12 of the LDP permits small scale wind turbine proposals subject to a number of criteria against which such proposals will be evaluated.

It is concluded that this is a small scale wind turbine and there is national and local planning policy support for the principle of this proposal, subject to the assessment of environmental criteria, which includes; the impact on the landscape, natural heritage; the need to minimise impacts on local communities and effects on the transportation network. There is therefore no objection in principle to the proposed wind turbine, subject to the other material planning considerations being satisfied.

## Landscape character and visual Impact

Regarding this main issue Policy AW12 of the LDP, which deals with renewable energy development, states that small scale wind turbines will be permitted where it can be demonstrated that there would be no unacceptable effect on, amongst other matters, landscape importance.

The proposed wind turbine would be located on an exposed site, on a prominent ridgeline, in the open countryside. It would be located within the SLA of Cwm Clydach. The site is also in near proximity to PROW's, open public spaces, scattered dwellings and the north and western parts of Ynysybwl. Given the location of the site, (which is detailed in full under the Site Appraisal) it is considered that the main landscape and visual effects of the proposal relate to the following matters:-

- The individual and cumulative effect on the character and appearance of the area, which is in a SLA; the nearby Rhondda Registered Landscape of Historic Interest and nearby heritage features (landscape effects)
- The effects on residents, especially those on the northern and western edges of Ynysybwl, (visual effects)
- The effects on users of local footpaths and other public open spaces in the area.
- The individual and cumulative effects of the proposed wind turbines.

The Landscape and Visual Assessment (LVIA) submitted to accompany the application incorporates an assessment of LANDMAP, wireline and photomontage visualisations from 14 key viewpoints and associated landscape, visual and cumulative assessments. The assessment was undertaken in February representing a worst case scenario for the assessment showing broad-leaved trees without foliage. The assessment considers the operational phase of 25-30 years, as well as temporary effects in terms of the construction and decommissioning phases. The

LVIA incorporates a 10km study area and a detailed study of 5km. The area of woodland assumed for the assessment has been modified to take into account NRW's felling plans for the area for the lifetime of the turbine and an assumed height of 8m.

#### Landscape effects

#### LANDMAP overall landscape character

The LANDMAP assessment of the area particularly the visual and sensory, historical, Llanwonno cultural Landmap aspect areas are considered particularly relevant in this case.

The LVIA states that for the Ynysybwl visual and sensory Landmap aspect area which would contain the turbines, there would be a Major impact on the local area of the site, which has been given a moderate susceptibility up to 1km with an overall Moderate/Large effect. The turbines would lie on a small ridgeline where the ground falls away quickly on either side and dominate much of the area contained within Mynachdy Farm. Large effects would be restricted to close range by topography. This effect would be important for the immediate surroundings, but in overall terms, it is considered that the area can accommodate the turbines and they would be in scale with the wider setting.

In the historic landscape aspect area, Llanwonno and Cwm Clydach, the turbines would not directly impact on any historical asset and there would be a Minor impact with a high sensitivity resulting in a Moderate effect, which would not influence the historical character of the area. The Schedule Ancient Monument (SAM) (H2) at Penrhiw Caradoc, Llanwonno lies at a distance of 2.5km with a moderate impact and moderate effect. These are not regarded as important.

In the cultural landscape aspect area, Llanwonno, there would be a Moderate impact and Moderate effect, but these are not regarded as important. The characteristics of this area is stated to be strongly agricultural. Two turbines within agricultural fields would not greatly detract from this character area and may be seen as part of modern farming. Within this area lies the Llanwonno Conservation Area which consists "of a church and burial ground and an incongruously large inn, sited in a forest clearing." The LVIA considers that this represents a small but high value group. The feeling of isolation here combined with its religious connotations mean that the turbines would be at odds with this aspect area. The view is filtered through intervening vegetation currently in place but when the NRW forestry is felled during the life of the turbines the view towards the turbines will open up. There will then be noticeable damage to the existing character of the area which would result in a moderate impact on an aspect area with high sensitivity resulting in a moderate/large effect. This is considered to be important.

The other effects on the geological and landscape habitats have been assessed as Slight or Neutral as there are no geological designations within the area and landscape and ecological impacts are minimal. The LVIA concludes that in overall terms the effects on LANDMAP aspect areas are not important. NRW agree with the findings of the LVIA that the major effects would occur within the area closest to the development, on the character of the Ynysybwl visual and sensory Landmap aspect area and Llanwonno cultural Landmap aspect area

### Special Landscape Area

It is considered that the first key policy and management within the SLA of Cwm Clydach, the site of the proposal, which is to conserve the skyline from Taff Vale and the written justification of SLA Policy NSA25 of the LDP "to the protection of the unspoilt valley slopes and ridges which form a visual backdrop to the settlements of the area" are considered particularly relevant to this proposal.

The LVIA which accompanies the application states that the magnitude of the effect on the Cwm Clydach SLA would be a Major impact in the immediate vicinity of the turbines within 1km of the turbines with a Moderate/ Large effect, which is important. The assessment considers that, in general terms the area can accommodate the proposal. These impacts are represented by **Photomontages V2 and V4**.

In terms of key policies for the SLA however, it is considered that there would not be any important effects. There would be minimal direct impact on landscape features in a very localised area, with no impact on wooded slopes, hedges or small woods, or historic hilltop sites. The secluded farmed character within the valley would not be influenced by the proposal and the skyline would not be visible from the Taff Valley, according to the ZTV.

The LVIA therefore considers that, whilst there would be some important visual and landscape effects in the immediate vicinity of the proposal, overall it concludes that there would not be an important effect on the key characteristics and policies for the Cwm Clydach SLA. It also concludes that the turbines would not have an important effect on the key characteristics and policies for the eight SLA's within the 10km study area.

## Registered Landscapes

The LVIA identifies that the turbine locations are adjacent to The Rhondda Registered Landscape of Historic Interest (RLHI,) at a distance of 1.4km at its closest point to the west/south west of the site. However, much of the area is outside the ZTV. Although the turbines would be visible from this area at greater range, when accounting for vegetation, topography and distance, the LVIA states that its impact would be greatly diminished. None of the SAMs or heritage assets which contribute to this area being an RLHI are within the ZTV for the Mynachdy turbines. The key qualities and characteristics creating this designation will not be impacted so a neutral overall effect is applied. The Rhondda RLHI also contains a number of existing wind farms (Fforch Nest, Pant y Wal, Ferndale and Maerdy) and the impact of a view of the two proposed turbines would be negligible in this context.

NRW agree that the proposal would not have significant adverse effect on the RLHI nor a major cumulative effect on the historic landscape. The turbines would add to the visual effects of wind turbines, but the major effects come from existing and approved large wind farms. NRW have noted that the LVIA has not assessed the effects on the Gelligaer Common Registered Landscape of Special Historic Interest but note that effects from Viewpoint 11 located within this landscape is assessed. This shows that the wind turbines would be apparent and that there would be some additional cumulative effect with existing wind farms, but this would not be significant.

It is therefore considered that the turbine would not have an important effect on the RLHI in landscape or visual terms.

It is accepted that the proposal would not significantly effect the SLA of the site, other nearby SLA's and registered landscapes.

#### Visual effects

Visual impacts and effects for individual receptors within a 2.5 kilometre radius of the turbine and on selected receptors up to 5 kilometres, within the ZTV have been assessed in detail. The ZTV shows that the proposed turbines would be screened from the main settlements of Cynon and the Rhondda Valleys by existing topography. The viewpoints are illustrated by a photomontage and are representative of views from dwellings and PROWS.

The visual assessment identifies that there would be very large effects for users of the PROW within 1 km of the site due to the close proximity of the turbines and their positioning on the ridgeline where there would be full views on the horizon of the turbines which would constitute a dominant discordant feature. These would include receptors along a 1km section of the PROW due west of the turbines , identified as footpath 'a', on Figure 12 which runs in close proximity to the base of the turbines. This view is illustrated by **Photomontage V2** located approximately 700 m from the site. There is also a very large effect identified for a section of the Sustrans Route (National Cycle Route 47) east of the proposed turbines, identified as 'i' on Figure 12. This view is illustrated by **Photomontage V4** located approximately 400m from the site. Large effects have been identified due to a major deterioration to views from highly sensitive receptors including a 250m section of PROW east of the turbine, identified as footpath 'b' on Figure 12.

Moderate impacts and large effects has been identified at **Photomontage V3**, located approximately 940 m from the site within the grounds of the churchyard at Llanwonno church where both nacelles of the turbines would be noticeable above the intervening forestry plantation. The NRW plans for the surrounding sections of forestry show that this woodland may be felled during the lifetime of the turbine which would open up the view considerably. However, the entrance to the church is more filtered and screened than the viewpoint location being on higher ground and screened by adjacent and intervening vegetation.

There would be Moderate effects for nearby sections of PROW's and a bridleway identified as footpaths c,d, g, and bridleway j (within 1km) and footpath f ( within 1.3km) on Figure 12. There is also a moderate effect is shown at **Photomontage V6** located at Gelli-Wrgan on a well used footpath near Miskin close to a SAM (H2) located approximately 2.5km from the site.

A Moderate effect is identified at **Photomontage V1** located approximately 1.5km from the site in a car park, close to a children's play area within the residential area of Buarth y Capel, Ynysybwl. The photomontage shows that views from this area would be clear, relatively unobstructed and in full view on the horizon.

Moderate impacts and effects are identified for several dwellings on the fringes of the settlement of Ynysybwl, in areas with north and west views towards the turbines at a range of 1.0 to 2.5 kilometres where the turbines would cause deterioration and damage to the view towards the site. These include receptors 5, 6, 9-14, 19, ,20, 25, 26, 28, 32, 34 and 38. These are views from or near the urban area of Ynysybwl which include other built elements in the foreground and which generally have vegetation in close proximity to filter and screen views. At this range there would be no impacts on their living conditions or residential amenity.

Slight/moderate effects inside the 2.5km range are identified for several individual dwellings, which would have some deterioration to views which would generally have oblique views partially filtered or distance views with vegetation screening the view. Similar effects are identified for the SAM Carn-y-wiwer Cairnfiled Photo and Platform House (H1) (**Photomontage 5**) located approximately 1.6km from the site where only the blade tips would be visible.

Slight effects are identified from public roads which have a low sensitivity and impacts ranging from negligible and minor to effects from neutral to slight. This is illustrated by Photomontage 13 (Llanwonno Road, Llysant).

The remaining viewpoints ranging from 4.9km to 9.2km are not considered to undergo significant effects in the assessment. Slight effects are shown for distant views V7 (National Trail), 8 (Trebanog),9 (ClydachVale Country Park), 10 (Aberfan Registered Park and Garden),11 (Cefn Gelligaer),12 (Treharris),) and 14 (north of Pontypridd).

The LVIA concludes that views at closer range such as Cae Maen, **Photomontage** V2 and Llanwonno **Photomontage V3** show the turbines as prominent, but not dominant, and Sustrans 47, **Photomontage V4** show the turbines as dominant features within the area directly surrounding the turbines. Others from a residential area in Ynysybwl **Photomontage V1**, and Gelli-Wrgan, Miskin **Photomontage V6** show the turbines as a skyline feature with a Moderate effect. Other longer distance viewpoints show the turbine in a wider context where it is seen with other existing windfarms such as Fforch Nest/ Pant y Wal resulting in comparatively less impact and effect.

NRW agree with the LVIA conclusions that the major adverse effects would occur from the viewpoints within 2.5km with a clear view, i.e. from V2, 3 ,4 and 13. In NRW's opinion the turbines are likely to be prominent up to 3km and conspicuous up to 6-7km where clearly visible.

## Cumulative effects

The cumulative LVIA (CLVIA) considers both the combined effect and the additional cumulative effect due to the proposal, involving a cumulative search area of 10km for other turbine schemes with full cumulative assessment of the eight nearest wind turbine schemes illustrated on Figure 13. In addition, cylindrical panoramas have been created from 9 viewpoints to illustrate cumulative effects.

The CLVIA states that there would not be any important additional effects on the Cwm Clydach SLA or adjacent SLA's. However, an additional moderate effect of local importance is identified for the Ynysybwl visual and sensory Landmap aspect area.

Some moderate additional effects are identified for the dwellings in Cribyn-du, (located to the south of Ynysybwl, 2.5km from the site) providing a view of turbines where currently there are none, but the majority of additional effects would be slight or neutral.

There would be some large combined effects and additional effects for some lengths of footpath b and Sustrans route i. Other PROW's would undergo moderate additional effects.

Viewpoints have been assessed. There would be some moderate combined effects where several windfarms are visible, as seen from Viewpoints 5 (Carn-y-wiwer), 7 (National Trial), Viewpoint 8 (Trebanog), Viewpoint 9 (Clydach Vale Country Park), Viewpoint 10 Aberfan and Viewpoint 11 (Cefn Gelligaer). Additional effects would be slight or neutral

From Viewpoint 5 (Carn–y-wiwer) the turbines would introduce turbines to an area of skyline where there are currently none but would not extend the visual influence of existing turbines of Fforch Nest/Pant y Wal.

From Viewpoint 7 (National Trail) a number of other turbines would be visible in the distant horizon and result in a moderate combined effect and a slight additional effect.

From Viewpoint 8 (Trebanog) the turbines would appear in a wide panorama with their blade tips visible over the ridgeline, and would not extend the influence of existing turbines.

From Viewpoint 9 (Clydach Vale Country Park) the turbines would be sat down in the landscape and generally inconspicuous from this distance.

From Viewpoint 10 (Aberfan) the wind turbines would increase the visual influence of the turbines within a section of the panoramic view which currently has no wind turbines but due to the distance and their small scale this effect would be slight.

From Viewpoint 11 (Cefn Gelligaer) the turbines would appear close to the Pant y Wal /Fforch Nest cluster but due to their small scale and closer position are not considered to increase the visual influence across the landscape.

NRW agree with the CLVIA that the combined effect would be moderate/large as the turbines would extend the influence of wind turbines further into the Ynysybwl visual and sensory aspect area where there are limited views of turbines currently and not at close range. NRW consider that the change is likely to turn the aspect area into a landscape character area with wind turbines. In their view this is not incompatible with areas within or immediately adjacent to SSA's.

## **Conclusions**

It is considered that the LVIA, which accompanies the application, does provide sufficient information and an adequate assessment upon which to base a decision on the acceptability of the proposed wind turbines. In summary, the key landscape and visual issues are as follows:

On the negative side:

- The turbines would appear isolated development in a landscape that is free from wind energy development
- There would be significant effects on the local visual and sensory aspect area, and the immediate environs of the turbines which is located within the Cwm Clydach SLA, as the turbines would be a new vertical component and key feature of the landscape.
- There would be a significant effect on the cultural landscape area of Llanwonno in the event of planned NRW clearance being undertaken during the life of the turbine.
- The greatest visual effects would be on users of the stretches of PROW's running in very close proximity to the turbines where the turbines would become dominating features.
- At a range of 1 to 2.5km there are residential properties which would have clear views of the turbines as a distinctive skyline feature in an otherwise unspoilt skyline. The turbines would be conspicuous up to 6-7 km where clearly visible but would be seen in a wider context with other existing wind farms.

In mitigation:-

• The proposal turbines are located within 0.5 km from the outer edge boundary of SSA'F' which is allocated as the main focus for wind energy development and in which landscape change is accepted.

- There would be no important effects on the key characteristics or policies of the Cwm Clydach SLA.
- A substantial amount of housing in Ynysybwl would have views screened/filtered towards the turbines by orientation of the dwellings, topography, intervening vegetation and existing dwellings/buildings. None would have an overbearing effect.
- The cumulative effects would be limited by views and distance from other existing or proposed wind turbines.
- The turbines would not have an important effect on the RLHI in landscape or visual terms due to topography and extensive NRW forestry plantations.
- The presence of the adjacent motor cross track is an existing detractor to the quiet secluded farming character of the area.

In summary, whilst it is acknowledged that there would be some significant adverse effects from the proposed turbines, the majority are at the lower end of the significance scale. The proposed development would also likely to lead to the immediate area becoming a landscape area with wind turbines which is however not incompatible with the location being immediately adjacent to SSA'F'. However, the merits of the individual development have to be explored. The turbines would be contained within the reclaimed valley sides, and would be read partially in the context of other wind energy developments and industrial uses. Whilst the adverse visual effects on a small number of residents in the Ynysybwl area is undesirable, the majority of residents would be screened from views towards the turbines by woodland belts, landform and other dwellings/buildings. Overall, the potential adverse effects need to be balanced against the benefits of clean energy, and in this case, on balance, it is considered that the benefits outweigh the effects and the proposal complies with the provisions of policies AW6 and AW12 of the LDP and paragraph 12.10.1 of Planning Policy Wales.

## Impact on residential amenity

The impacts on adjacent residential uses as a result of noise and visual disturbance due to shadow flicker/reflected light also need to be considered. The applicant has not provided a technical assessment in respect of noise from the turbines. This is due to a lack of noise emission data from the manufacturer which is expected to become available in 2016. However, the applicant has identified that the nearest residential property is 662m from the closest turbine and the next closest is the Brynfynnon Public House in Llanwonno which is around 860m from the closest turbine.

The Assessment and Rating of Noise from Wind Farms (The ETSU Report 1997) referred to in TAN8 provides indicative noise levels which would provide a reasonable degree of protection to wind farm neighbours. The ETSU Report recommends that predicted noise levels should not exceed 35 dB LA90, 10 min.(dB)

The indicative maximum noise level of a wind farm at 350m is in the region of 35-45 dB. However, as the nearest residential properties are located at the following

distances to the turbines 662m (Dduallt Farm) and 860m (Brynfynnon PH Llanwonno) it is considered that the installation would be capable of complying with the guidance set out in respect of the noise levels from turbines as set out above.

A Shadow Light Flicker statement has been provided. The statement notes that only properties within 130 degrees either side of north in the UK would be affected at the proposed latitude of the site, and that shadow flicker assessment should be carried out if there are any residential properties within 10 rotor diameter distance of the proposed wind turbine. The statement indicates that as the rotor diameter of the wind turbine is 35m, shadow flicker could potentially be an issue for a residential property within 350m. However, as there are no residential properties within or close to this impact zone, this would not be an issue at this site.

The construction phase of the development also has the potential to have an impact on the amenities of local residents. However, the construction activities are of short term duration and conditions could be imposed in order to control the hours of operation.

The Council's Public Health and Protection Division has raised no objection to the proposed turbines, subject to conditions which cover noise limits at the nearest residential properties and a complaint system. Further, in respect of construction activities, conditions are recommended to cover hours of operation and minimisation of dust. It is considered that, subject to the imposition of appropriate conditions, the turbine is not likely to cause undue noise and disturbance to the nearest residential properties.

## Ecology/agricultural land quality

The potential impact on ecology of the proposed development route has been assessed, by Acer Ecology, and this is reported in their Ecological Assessment December 2014.

The ecological assessment shows that the habitats to be lost for the proposed development including the location of the turbines, access tracks and cable routes are of minimal ecological value. The Assessment shows that work would be required to trim back vegetation along sections of the delivery route but this would not exceed the scope of standard yearly maintenance required. The Assessment makes recommendations in Section 7 Bat Access Track in case some of the mature trees on the access track require some remedial works to facilitate plant access. The Assessment has also considered works required to construct the access area and provides a detail of areas within the site which may be impacted by the proposal and the protection required in mitigation

The assessment shows very low levels of bat usage and low levels of bird usage including grey heron and red kite which are considered to be of high potential risk from turbines. There is nightjar usage within the NRW forestry plantation within 1km of a turbine which is considered to be of "high sensitivity" for this species. However,

the pasture land of the site is considered to be of low potential as foraging habitat and precautionary mitigation measures are proposed.

The Council's Ecologist has advised that the site is one of limited ecological value and that it is unlikely to significantly affect any significant habitat or protected species, but the recommended mitigation contained within Section 7 should be imposed as conditions to any consent granted in order to reduce impacts to a minimum. These would secure a Wildlife and habitat Protection Plan relating to tree works, nesting birds and specific measures to minimise disturbance of nightjars and precautionary measures for badgers and reptiles and a long term management plan for areas around the turbines and monitoring for bird and bat mortality and nightjar surveys. NRW have raised no objections regarding ecology matters subject to the ecological assessment recommendations being subject to suitably worded conditions to ensure their implementation.

In terms of agricultural land quality, the wind turbine and associated works and assess would involve a small piece of land within the applicants farm holding on land which appears to be within Grade 4 or 5 of the agricultural classification maps. Whilst there are no restoration details submitted it is considered that these details could be secured by an appropriate condition.

It is therefore considered that there would be no ecological or agricultural constraint to the development, subject to the imposition of appropriate conditions.

## Highway Safety and PROW matters

The proposed development would involve a total of 202 HGV vehicular movements to and from the site over a 3 month period, with 29 HGV movements on the busiest days. There would also be a maximum of 5 abnormal load trips required for the delivery of the wind turbine components and cranes required for the installation over a 1 week period. The routine maintenance of the turbines would require a visit 3-4 times a year with a medium sized van.

A route feasibility study swept path analysis and constraints assessment has been carried out for the abnormal load route required for the delivery of the turbine components to Mynachdy Farm. The proposed route for the abnormal loads utilises A and B roads before turning into Mynachdy Road for approximately 200m before entering the entrance to the farm. The submitted sweptpath analysis shows that the deliveries would be accommodated without any removal of street furniture or mitigation measures but may require temporary parking restrictions along three roads within Ynysybwl. Within the farm, the access would follow an existing track for approximately 700m which will be resurfaced to form a smooth even surface and a new track of approximately 550m in length would be constructed together with parking and turning area.

The Council's Transportation Section has advised that the information submitted shows that the turbine components and construction vehicles for the proposed medium scale wind turbines can safely access the site and that the impact on the local road network and local residents is acceptable. However, there is concern that use of the Y Ffrwd Bridge structure has tight radii for the abnormal loads and therefore would require a trial run prior to the transport of an abnormal loads.

The Council's Transportation Section have raised no objections to the proposed development subject to conditions to secure a traffic management plan for abnormal loads, a condition survey for local loads with the view to addressing any damage caused by the proposal, and wheel washing facilities.

In view of the short duration and limited use of vehicles required during the limited construction period and subject to conditions as set out above it is considered that, the proposed development of the wind turbine is not anticipated to have an adverse impact on highway safety. The need for a condition survey however, is considered too onerous in view of the limited traffic likely to be generated by the construction, operation and decommissioning of the proposed wind turbine.

The use of the existing farm access for the construction and maintenance of the wind turbines would include a short length of PROW YCC/12/1 and the proposed development would be located in close proximity to PROW Ref YCC/15/2. Para 2:25 of TAN 8 advises that any wind turbine should be a minimum distance of the height of the blade tip from the edge of the public highway. As the nearest PROW to the turbines, Ref YCC/15/2, would be approximately 110m for the nearest southerly wind turbine, and the wind turbine is 67.5m to blade tip, the development would conform to this guidance.

The Council's Rights of Way Officer has raised concern about the possible safety impact and the ability of the public to continue to enjoy using these public footpaths, during the development, but especially during the construction period. The Council's Rights of Way Officer has advised that should there be any risk to users of any PROW, then the applicant would need to apply to the Council for a temporary closure order. It is therefore considered that any impact on the PROW can be dealt with by means of a condition to secure health and safety precautions, for each stage of the development.

It is therefore considered that there would be no highway safety constraints to the development, subject to the imposition of appropriate conditions

## Historic Environment and Archaeology

The supporting information includes an Historic Environment Assessment prepared by Trysor (report no 2014/423, dated March 2015). This includes a Desk Based Assessment which identified all known historic assets within 2.1km of the intended site of the turbines and assessed the impact on these assets. Of these, one Scheduled Ancient Monument is identified which would experience a very Low Impact and one listed building, Llanwonno Church would have a low indirect visual impact. A similar assessment was conducted on assets from 2.1 to 5.1 km from the site and there is a low or very low impact on two of the 80 assets, the remaining 78 not being impacted. A field visit was undertaken to gather information, including recording any previously unknown assets. The field visit confirmed the presence of two features which were seen on aerial photographs, and as a result of this the routes of the access track and cable trench have been adjusted to take these features into consideration.

The assessment recommends further mitigation in the form of an archaeological evaluation where the access track crosses the trackway feature observed in the site visit, with watching briefs during ground disturbing works on the south west end of the trackway, sections of the cable trench and at the turbine bases, due to their proximity to a previously unrecorded defended enclosure.

Cadw have advised that in their opinion the impact of the turbines on the setting of nearby monuments would be negligible and low. Cadw also advise that it is unlikely that the proposed turbines would impact on the setting of the registered historic park and garden at Aberfan Cemetery and that impact on the setting of the Registered Rhondda Landscape of Special Historic Interest would be negligible.

GGAT have reviewed the report and have advised that it meets current professional standards. No objections are raised subject to a condition requiring the applicant to submit a detailed programme of investigation for the archaeological resource, to any consent granted, to be worded in a manner similar to the model given in Welsh Office Circular 60/96, Section 23. GGAT advise that this would take the form of an evaluation excavation and watching briefs during any ground disturbing activity, as detailed above with contingency arrangements to provide for sufficient time and resources to record and, if necessary, excavate any features, any post excavation work and the production of a report.

It is therefore considered that the proposed development would not have a significant detrimental impact on the historic environment and existing archaeological resource and be in keeping with the provisions of policy AW7.

## Aviation Issues

Wind turbines have the potential to pose a threat to air safety for two reasons. Firstly, they can represent a collision risk for low flying aircraft and secondly they can interfere with ground based control radar and aircraft landing instruments.

The site falls within a 30 kilometres radius of Cardiff Airport and is therefore subject to mandatory consultation. No formal response has been received at the time of writing the report, but are expected to be received at Committee so that the response can be given orally at Committee.

## Economic and Environmental Benefits

PPW and the LDP require the economic considerations of proposed wind turbines to be considered. As the proposal involves a small scale renewable energy development, the application is required by Policy AW12 of the LDP to demonstrate that the proposal would not constrain the generating capacity of the refined strategic search area for large scale wind farm developments. As the development involves small wind turbines it is considered that it would not affect any future development of a large scale wind turbine development within SSAF.

The proposal would primarily benefit the applicant, and the farm owner as part of a farm diversification scheme. All surplus energy generation would be sold to the National Grid, which would provide a small contribution in the delivery of renewable energy targets.

#### Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL)

The Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) was introduced in Rhondda Cynon Taf from 31 December 2014.

The application is for development of a kind that is not CIL liable under the CIL Regulations 2010 (as amended).

### Community Benefits

The applicant is proposing community benefits involving an initial sum of £15,000 and a further £2,000 per year (index linked) for 20 years to be paid to the local community to support local initiatives.

The applicant has also stated that the proposal would bring benefits to the local economy in providing 10 - 20 short term jobs for all the civil engineering works associated with the construction works.

It should be noted however, that the community benefit is not put forward as mitigation and should not be a material consideration in the determination of this planning application.

#### Other Considerations

In relation to drainage matters, were the application to be otherwise acceptable, a condition requiring the details of the treatment of surface water matters would be imposed, in order to ensure that there would be no detrimental impact on flood risk for the local environment.

The applicant has advised there would be no grid connection problems as the connection would take place in an underground cable to a transformer station.

In relation to policy AW12.2, of the LDP, the proposed development is considered unlikely to unnecessarily sterilise or hinder the resources of sandstone on the application site and adjacent land as the proposed development is of a temporary nature.

#### Conclusion

The development represents a small scale wind development that would contribute to the Welsh Government's commitment to optimising renewable energy generation, as set out in Section 12 of PPW. Furthermore, having assessed the impacts of the development on the character/quality of the landscape, the visual amenity from nearby residential areas and potential cumulative impact with existing and proposed wind turbines in the vicinity; it is considered that the proposed development can reasonably be accommodated within the landscape without significant harm to its character and integrity. In addition to this, no objections have been raised by statutory consultees with respect to the potential impacts upon either the amenity of nearby residential properties, highway safety or ecology. Therefore, it is considered that any harm caused by this development would not outweigh the objectives of both local and national planning policy, which seek to promote development proposals that meet national and local renewable energy targets.

As such, having regard to all the matters raised above, it is recommended that on balance, the application should be approved, subject to the conditions set out below.

Recommendation: Grant, subject to receiving confirmation of no objection from Cardiff Airport and that the Service Director, Planning, be authorised to consider and add any condition/s as may be requested for imposition by Cardiff Airport.

## **RECOMMENDATION:** Grant

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of five years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with Sections 91 and 93 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2. The permission hereby granted shall endure for a period of 25 years from the date when electricity is first exported from a wind turbine within the site to the electricity grid network ('First Export Date'). Written confirmation of the First Export date shall be notified in writing by the developer to the Local Planning Authority within one month of the First Export Date.

Not later than 12 months before the expiry date of the permission, a decommissioning and site restoration scheme shall be submitted for the written approval of the Local Planning Authority. Such a scheme will include for:

- the removal of all surface elements, plus one metre of the turbine bases below ground level,
- confirmation of the management and timing of works;
- a traffic management plan to fully address highway issues during the period of the decommissioning works;
- any other works of restoration and aftercare, following consultation with other parties, as the Local Planning Authority

deem to be reasonable and necessary.

The approved decommissioning schemes shall be implemented and completed within 24 months of the expiry date of this permission.

Reason: To ensure derelict or obsolete structures do not adversely affect the environment in accordance with policies CS1, AW5, AW7, AW8, AW12 and NSA25 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

- 3. The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents unless otherwise approved and superseded by details required by any other condition attached to this consent or unless otherwise submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority:-
  - Location Plan Drwg No. MYNACHDYSP-1D
  - Site Plan Drwg No. MYNACHDYSP-1E
  - Overalls/Planning -250-50-35
  - Substation Elevations Drwg No. P208(01)-25-01-D
  - Electronics Enclosure Drwg No. EE.600-A
  - Design and Access Statement dated May 2015
  - Additional Planning Information dated May 2015.

Reason: To ensure compliance with the approved plans and documents and to clearly define the scope of the permission.

4. Operations shall not be commenced until details of the colour and external finish of the turbines and associated structures, proposed to be used have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and all materials used shall conform to the sample(s) so approved.

Reason: To ensure that the external appearance of the proposed development will be in keeping with the character of the area in the interests of visual amenity in accordance with Policies AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

5. The wind turbines shall be of a 3 bladed configuration and not exceed an overall height of 67.5m to the tip of the turbine blades. The turbines shall not display any prominent name, logo, symbol, sign or advertisement on any external surface unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The turbines shall not be illuminated and there shall be no permanent illumination on the site, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interest of visual amenity in accordance with policies AW12, AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

6. In the event that any of the turbines do not function (i.e. does not supply electricity to the grid) for a continuous period of 12 months and if so instructed by the Local Planning Authority; the wind turbine and its associated ancillary equipment shall be dismantled, and its base removed to a depth of one metre below ground level, and removed from the site within a period of 6 months from the end of that 12 month period, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity and to ensure that the turbine is not obsolete, produce electricity whilst in situ and is removed from the site if it ceases to function, in accordance with policies CS1, AW5, AW7, AW8, and AW12 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

7. All electricity and control cables between the turbines and the switch room shall be laid underground, unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To minimise environmental impact in the vicinity of the site in accordance with policy AW12 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

8. Construction work on the site, excluding the delivery of abnormal loads and actual erection of the wind turbines, shall be confined to the hours of 0700 - 1900 Mondays to Sundays unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To minimise impact on the amenities of local residents in accordance with Policy AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

9. The rating level of noise immissions from the combined effects of the wind turbines (including the application of any tonal penalty), when determined in accordance with the attached Guidance Notes, shall not exceed the values for the relevant interger wind speed set out in, or derived from, the tables attached to these conditions at any dwelling. For the purpose of this condition a 'dwelling' is defined as a building within Use Class C3 of the Town & Country Planning (Use Classes) Order 1987 which lawfully exists or has planning permission at the date of this consent.

Reason: To protect the amenity of residents in accordance with policies AW5 and AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

10. The wind farm operator shall continuously log power production, wind speed and wind direction, all in accordance with Guidance Note 1(d). These data shall be retained for a period of not less than 24 months. The wind farm operator shall provide this information in the format set out in Guidance Note 1(e) to the Local Planning Authority on its request, within 14 days of receipt in writing of such a request.

Reason: To protect the amenity of residents in accordance with policies AW5 and AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

11. Within 21 days from receipt of a written request from the Local Planning Authority, following a complaint to it from an occupant of a dwelling alleging noise disturbance at that dwelling, the wind farm operator shall, at its expense, employ a consultant approved by the Local Planning Authority to assess the level of noise immissions from the wind farm at the complainant's property in accordance with the procedures in the attached Guidance Notes. The written request from the Local Planning Authority shall set out at least the date, time and location that the complainant relates to and any identified atmospheric conditions, including wind direction, and if possible include a statement as to whether, in the opinion of the Local Planning Authority, the noise giving rise to the complaint contains or is likely to contain a tonal component.

Reason: To protect the amenity of residents in accordance with policies AW5 and AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

12. Prior to the commencement of any measurements by the independent consultant to be undertaken in accordance with this condition, the wind farm operator shall submit to the Local Planning Authority for written approval the proposed measurement location identified in accordance with the Guidance Notes where measurements for compliance checking purposes shall be undertaken, whether noise giving rise to the complaint contains or is likely to contain a tonal component, and also the range of meteorological and operational conditions (which shall include the range of wind speeds, wind directions, power generation and times of day) to determine the assessment of rating level of noise immissions. The proposed range of conditions shall be those which prevailed during times when the complainant alleges there was disturbance due to noise, having regard to the written request of the Local Planning Authority under condition 11, and such others as the independent consultant considers likely to result in a breach of the noise limits.

Reason: To protect the amenity of residents in accordance with policies AW5 and AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

13. Where a dwelling to which a complaint is related is not listed in the tables attached to these conditions, the wind farm operator shall submit to the Local Planning Authority for written approval proposed noise limits selected from those listed in the Tables to be adopted at the complainant's dwelling for compliance checking purposes. The proposed noise limits are to be those limits selected from the Tables specified for a listed location which the independent consultant considers as being likely to experience the most similar background noise environment to that experienced at the complainant's dwelling. The rating level of noise immissions resulting from

the combined effects of the wind turbines when determined in accordance with the attached Guidance Notes shall not exceed the noise limits approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority for the complainant's dwelling.

Reason: To protect the amenity of residents in accordance with policies AW5 and AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

14. The wind farm operator shall provide to the Local Planning Authority the independent consultant's assessment of the rating level of noise immissions undertaken in accordance with the Guidance Notes within 2 months of the date of the written request of the Local Planning Authority for compliance measurements to be made under condition 11, unless the time limit is extended in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The assessment shall include all data collected for the purposes of undertaking the compliance measurements, such data to be provided in the format set out in Guidance Note 1(e) of the Guidance Notes. The instrumentation used to undertake the measurements shall be calibrated in accordance with Guidance Note 1(a) and certificates of calibration shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority with the independent consultant's assessment of the rating level of noise immissions.

Reason: To protect the amenity of residents in accordance with policies AW5 and AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

15. Where a further assessment of the rating level of noise immissions from the wind farm is required pursuant to Guidance Note 4(c), the wind farm operator shall submit a copy of the further assessment within 21 days of submission of the independent consultant's assessment pursuant to condition 14 above unless the time limit has been extended in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To protect the amenity of residents in accordance with policies AW5 and AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

16. Once the Local Planning Authority has received the independent consultant's noise assessment required by this condition, including all noise measurements and any audio recordings, where the Local Planning Authority is satisfied of an established breach of the noise limits set out in the attached tables 1 and 2, upon notification by the Local Planning Authority in writing to the wind farm operator of the said breach, the wind farm operator shall within 21 days propose a scheme for the approval of the Local Planning Authority. The scheme shall be designed to mitigate the breach and to prevent its future recurrence. This scheme shall specify the timescales for implementation. The scheme shall be implemented as reasonably approved by the Local Planning Authority and according to the timescales within it. The scheme as implemented shall be retained

thereafter unless otherwise agreed with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To protect the amenity of residents in accordance with policies AW5 and AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

Table 1 During Night time hours of 23:00-07:00:-

Assessment Location	Wind Speed at 10m Height m/s								
	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
Dduallt Farm	35	35	35	35	35	35	35	35	35

Table 2 At all other times:-

Assessment Location	Wind Speed at 10m Height m/s								
	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
Dduallt Farm	35	35	35	35	35	35	35	35	35

Note: A Plan showing the exact location of the above property is attached to this decision notice

17. Notwithstanding the provisions of conditions 9–16, the wind farm operator shall undertake measurements of noise levels using an appropriately qualified noise consultant during the first year of the operation of the wind turbines in a scheme to be agreed with the Local Planning Authority to demonstrate that compliance with the noise levels in condition 9 are being met. The data produced in accordance with the scheme shall be forwarded to the Local Planning Authority within 28 days of the measurements being undertaken.

Reason: To protect the amenity of residents in accordance with policies AW5 and AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

- 18. No development shall take place until a Species and Habitat Protection and Mitigation Plan for Construction has been submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The plan shall include all the ecological assessment recommendations within Paragraph 8.3 of the Additional Planning Information dated May 2015 and the following matters:-
  - An appropriate scale plan showing 'Wildlife Protection Zones' where construction activities are restricted and where protective measures will be installed or implemented;
  - Details of protective measures (both physical measures and sensitive
working practices) to avoid or reduce impacts during construction;

- A timetable to show phasing of construction activities to avoid periods of the year when sensitive wildlife could be harmed (such as nesting bird season, reptiles, etc.)
- Details of specific species and habitat mitigation measures
- Persons responsible for:
  - Compliance with legal consents relating to nature conservation;
  - Compliance with planning conditions relating to nature conservation;
  - Installation of physical protection measures during construction;
  - Implementation of sensitive working practices during construction;
  - Regular inspection and maintenance of physical protection measures and monitoring of working practices during construction;
  - Specific species and Habitat Mitigation measures
  - Provision of training and information about the importance of the 'Wildlife Protection Zones' to all construction personnel on site.

All construction activities shall be implemented with the approved details and timing of the plan unless agreed otherwise in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

19. No development shall take place until the details of the process of reporting incidental bat and bird strikes and the re surveying of night jars to the Local Planning Authority has been agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter, the required reports shall be provided to the Local Planning Authority in accordance with the agreed details.

Reason: To afford protection to animal and plant species in accordance with policies AW5 and AW8 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

- 20. No development shall take place until a Traffic Management Plan (TMP) has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Any temporary mitigation measures affecting public highway shall be implemented prior to transportation of the abnormal loads and reinstated upon completion of the development. The TMP shall include the following:-
  - Swept Path Analysis (showing full route and mitigation measures);
  - Component size (width, height, length, weight;
  - Convoy Length (number of vehicles including emergency services and escorts);
  - Traffic Management (during transportation of abnormal loads);
  - Structures (over bridges height, width, weight restrictions);

- Highway works (including all temporary works to public highway to facilitate access and reinstatement works including timescales);
- Dry Run (to be witnessed by highway authority and police);
- Temporary Traffic Regulation Orders; and
- Emergency Contingencies.

The development shall be completed in accordance with the Traffic Management Plan.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety / to ensure safe and satisfactory delivery of all components.

21. Prior to the commencement of the development, a report indicating a methodology for undertaking a conditions survey of the local roads that could be affected by the proposed development shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The report should include: the timescales for undertaking the surveys and the method(s) of reporting the findings to the Local Planning Authority; comprehensive photographs; and potential compensation arrangements. The development shall not be brought into use until the final survey on completion of the development hereby approved and any compensation arrangements have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure that the extraordinary traffic use arising from the proposed development does not have an adverse impact on highway safety.

22. Prior to the commencement of development, facilities for wheel cleansing shall be provided on site in accordance with details submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Wheel cleaning shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details prior to any construction works commencing.

Reason: In the interests of road safety.

23. In the interests of air safety, the turbines shall be fitted with aviation lighting. The turbine should be fitted with 25 candela omni-directional red lighting or infrared lighting with an optimised flash pattern of 60 flashes per minute of 200ms to 500ms duration at the highest practicable point, unless agreed otherwise in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of air safety.

24. No development shall take place until full drainage arrangements have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The turbine shall not be brought into use until drainage arrangements have been completed in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure adequate disposal of foul and surface water drainage in accordance with Policy AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

25. No development shall take place until the applicant, or their agents or successors in title, has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order that the archaeological operations are undertaken to an acceptable standard and that legitimate archaeological interest in the site is satisfied in accordance with Policy AW7 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

\_\_\_\_\_

APPLICATION NO:	15/0795/10 (HL)
APPLICANT:	Rhondda Housing Association
DEVELOPMENT:	The demolition of existing buildings on site, and the construction of 14 no. affordable residential dwellings.
LOCATION:	TY GWYN PSYCHOLOGICAL CENTRE, LAND TO THE WEST OF SEATON STREET, PONTYPRIDD, CF37 1JA
DATE REGISTERED:	30/06/2015
ELECTORAL DIVISION:	Rhondda

**RECOMMENDATION:** Approve, subject to a Section 106 Agreement

**REASONS:** 

The application proposes the development of affordable housing on a previously developed site within the defined settlement limits. The proposal is in keeping with policies SSA1, AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan and National Policy in that it is acceptable in terms of scale, layout, design, its impact on the residential amenity of surrounding properties and highway safety.

#### APPLICATION DETAILS

The application seeks full planning permission for the development of 14 residential units on the site of the former Ty Gwyn Psychological Centre, to the west of Seaton Street, Pontypridd. The accommodation would be provided within two No, three

storey apartment blocks, each containing six apartments and two detached bungalows.

The proposed apartment blocks would each measure 18m wide, 11.2m deep with a maximum height of 11.3m falling to 8.1m at eaves level. Each apartment would contain a kitchen-living area, one bedroom, a bathroom and internal storage.

The apartments would be positioned on the southern part of the site, to the west of Seaton Street. Apartment block one would be positioned 7m to the west of Frondeg, at the western end of Seaton Street, adjacent to the eastern boundary of the plot. The building would be positioned at least 1.2m behind the building line established by the dwellings on the southern side of Seaton Street. The building would be orientated to face north over the wider application site and the rear elevations of the properties in Barry Road.

Block two would be positioned 2m to the east of the western boundary and 18m to the west of block one. The principle elevation of the building would be east facing. The building would be of the same design as block one. The ridge height of the apartment blocks would be 2.2m-2.85m higher than the ridge line of the properties along the southern side of Seaton Street and 2.8m higher than the ridge of the main existing building.

Externally both blocks would be finished with re-constituted stone and brick, upvc windows and doors and a concrete tiled roof. Each block would benefit from an area of communal open space around the building and a detached bin store. Parking for 12 vehicles and an on-site turning area would be provided between the two buildings with access gained from Seaton Street.

The proposed bungalows would be positioned in the northern part of the site to the south (rear) of the properties in Barry Road. Each bungalow would measure 11.2m wide, 9.5m deep with a maximum height of 6m falling to 2.4m at eaves level. Internally the accommodation would include a kitchen-diner, living room, two bedrooms and a bathroom. Externally the buildings would be finished with brick elevations, upvc windows and door and a concrete tiled roof. An area of private amenity area would be provided around the buildings. Access to the bungalows would be via Barry Road to the north, leading to a parking forecourt and turning area for four cars.

The embankment between the apartment blocks and the bungalows would be regraded and landscaped.

The application is accompanied by:

- Design and Access Statement;
- Preliminary Ecological Appraisal;
- Bat Survey;
- Drainage Strategy report and

• Transport Statement.

# SITE APPRAISAL

The application site comprises a roughly square shaped parcel of land with an area of approximately 0.28 hectares located within the Rhondda ward and the settlement boundary of the principle town of Pontypridd. The site is currently occupied by the former Ty Gwyn Psychological Centre and a number of out buildings.

The site is on two levels separated by an embankment which falls from south to north. The boundaries are largely defined by stone walls with a minimum height of 2m. A public footpath and cycle path runs adjacent to the southern boundary. The northern perimeter is bound by a lane which provides rear access to Barry Road. Allotments and mature woodland border the west of the site, while to the east there is a lane providing pedestrian access between Seaton Street and Golygfa'r Eglwys.

The surrounding area is predominantly characterised by streets of traditional two storey terraced dwellings with estates of new build dwellings located to the south within Bryn Eglwys and Golygfar Eglwys. Although the dwellings in the area are predominantly two storey in design, the rear elevations of the properties in St Marks Villas, Seaton Street and some properties along Pantygraigwen Road to the north, are three storey in height and visible from the site.

# PLANNING HISTORY

There is no previous planning consent for the site.

# PUBLICITY

The application has been advertised by direct neighbour notification letters, erection of site notices and publication of a press notice.

10 letters of objection and a petition containing 45 signatures have been received. The letters and petition are summarised below:

## Material considerations

Amenity:

- Increased overshadowing and loss of light;
- Concerns that the three storey height of the apartment blocks will be out of keeping with the area;
- The proximity of the apartments to Frondeg will adversely affect the amenity value of the property;
- The front facing balconies will generate increased overlooking and loss of privacy;
- Three storey buildings adjacent to the entrance to Barry Sidings will discourage use of the path;

- Request that the car parking area be provided nearer to the entrance and the buildings moved further away from existing houses;
- Request that construction be limited to the five day working week to limit noise and impact on weekends;
- Request that haulage lorries be sheeted and hosed down to restrict the amount of noise and dust.

Highways:

- Significant increase in traffic movements along Seaton Street to the detriment of highway safety;
- The proposed access to the bungalows will have a detrimental impact on the access to 15 and 16 Barry Road;
- Concerns that access to the rear of Barry Road will become obstructed;
- The roads in the area are of limited width with double parking already evident. Use of the road by heavy machinery will have a detrimental impact on the highway surface and existing on street parking;
- Insufficient level of on-site parking proposed will result in overflow onto Seaton Street which is already congested with double parking;
- Request relocation of the bungalows to provide another entrance/exit point directly from Barry Road to alleviate pressure and traffic flow along Seaton Street.

Drainage:

• The existing drainage in the area is inadequate leading to problems in the lane to the rear of Barry Road.

Ecology:

• A mature oak and other mature trees have been removed from the site to the detriment of the areas ecology.

# Non-material issues:

- De-valuation of properties;
- Heavy machinery working on the site may have a detrimental effect on the stability of homes and existing boundary features;
- Concerns with regards to future tenants;
- Development will generate noise, dust, dirt and pollution;
- Storage of haulage lorries and industrial building equipment on the site;
- Height of the buildings will diminish views and panorama;
- Concerns regarding the consultation process and the lack of neighbour letters issued.

# CONSULTATION

Transportation Section – no objection subject to conditions.

Public Health and Protection – no objections subject to advice regarding demolition; hours of operation; noise; dust and waste.

Ecology – no objections subject to conditions.

Landscape and Countryside – the development will have an impact on the trees to the south of the site adjacent to the Barry Sidings path. Conditions recommended.

Land Reclamation and Engineering – no objections subject to conditions.

Welsh Water/ Dwr Cymru – no objections subject to conditions.

Wales and West Utilities – advice provided regarding the position of apparatus.

Natural Resources Wales – raise no objections.

South Wales Police – advice provided with regard to designing out crime.

# POLICY CONTEXT

## Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan

The site is located within the Rhondda ward and within the settlement boundary of the principle town of Pontypridd.

The relevant policies in the Local Development Plan are as follows:

**Policy CS2** - sets out criteria for achieving sustainable growth including, promoting and enhancing transport infrastructure services promoting residential development with a sense of place and focusing development within defined settlement boundaries.

**Policy AW1** defines the housing land supply, to be met partly by development of unallocated land in Principal Towns, Key Settlements and Smaller Settlements.

**Policy AW2** promotes development in sustainable locations, which includes site within settlements boundaries, benefiting from existing services and sites that support the roles and functions of Key Settlements. The locations should not unacceptably conflict with surrounding uses.

**Policy AW5** lists amenity and accessibility criteria that will be supported in new development proposals.

**Policy AW6** outlines design and placemaking criteria that will be supported in new development proposals

**Policy AW8** specifies that the Authority's natural heritage will be preserved and enhanced by protecting it from inappropriate development.

**Policy AW10** seeks to ensure that development proposals will not be permitted where they would result in a risk of unacceptable harm to heath or local amenity

**Policy SSA1** outlines criteria that will be supported for development in the Principal Town

**Policy SSA11** seeks a minimum housing density of 35 dwellings per Hectare and gives criteria for accepting lower densities.

**Policy SSA12** seeks the provision of 20% affordable housing on residential development of 10 units or more.

**Policy SSA13** gives further criteria for suitable housing development within and adjacent to settlement boundaries.

The following SPG is also relevant to this proposal:

- Design and Placemaking;
- Affordable Housing;
- Access Circulation & Parking Requirements.

## National Guidance

In the determination of planning applications regard should also be given to the requirements of National Planning Policy which are not duplicated in the Local Development Plan, particularly where National Planning Policy provides a more up to date and comprehensive policy on certain topics.

Planning Policy Wales, Chapter 2 (Development Plans), Chapter 3 (Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions) Chapter 4 (Planning for Sustainability) 8 (Transport) and 9 (Housing) set out the Welsh Government's policy on planning issues relevant to the determination of the application.

Other relevant policy guidance consulted:

- PPW Technical Advice Note 5: Nature Conservation and Planning;
- PPW Technical Advice Note 12: Design;
- PPW Technical Advice Note 18: Transport;
- Manual for Streets.

## REASONS FOR REACHING RECOMMENDATION

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purposes of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. Furthermore, applications that are not in accordance with relevant policies in the plan should not be allowed, unless material considerations justify the grant of planning permission.

As detailed above, the application proposes the development of 14 residential units on previously developed land, located within the defined settlement boundary of Pontypridd. As such the principle of residential development is considered acceptable. The key considerations with regards to the application have been determined as the impact on the proposal on the character and appearance on the area, the residential amenity of those living closest to the site, highway safety and ecology implications. Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires planning decisions to be made in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

#### Character and Appearance of the Area

As specified above the application proposes the development of 14 residential units provided by way of a pair of three storey, detached apartment blocks each containing six, one-bedroom apartments and two detached two-bedroom bungalows. On the whole it is considered that the density of development in association with the overall design of the properties would not have a significantly detrimental impact on the overall character and appearance on the area.

The three storey height of the apartment blocks has been an area of concern for both Officers and residents throughout the processing of the application. The positioning of the site on the southern side of the valley in association with the removal of mature vegetation from the embankment would make any development on the site extremely prominent when viewed from areas to the north. Furthermore the increased ridge height of the apartment blocks relative to the two storey height of the properties in Seaton Street would add to their visual prominence. However, being mindful of the buildings position on the valley side, the properties would always benefit from the back drop of the trees along the wider hillside and properties above to the rear (south).

Although, obviously more modern in appearance and taller than the predominant property type in the area, it is considered that the apartment blocks would not break the horizon, their siting with the back drop of valley side and properties to the south, use of stone facing on the most prominent northern and eastern elevations, and design to provide a break in the roofscape would allow the buildings to assimilate more comfortably within the overall context of the wider area.

Further to a number of site visits it has been confirmed that there are a number of three storey elevations evident within the immediate locality.

With regards to the bungalows, as indicated above, these would be developed on the lower plateau of the site. Although the internal floor height would be raised relative to the properties within Barry Road, it is considered that the properties would be largely screened from view by the existing terrace, the retention of the southern boundary wall and the maintenance of 7m distance between the buildings and the boundary. It is considered that the repair and retention of the existing boundary wall could be dealt with by an appropriately worded condition.

It is therefore considered that the development proposed would provide an appropriate and acceptable infill to replace the existing buildings and would not be so detrimental to the overall character and appearance of the area to warrant refusal of the application. The application is therefore considered compliant with the requirements of policies AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

## **Residential amenity**

The site is located within an established residential area with properties located to the north, east and south of the site.

Based on the plans submitted it has been determined that a minimum distance of 7m would be maintained between the side elevation of apartment block one and the western (side) elevation of the closest residential dwelling: Frondeg. While the small balcony on the northern elevation, serving the first and second floor flats would project up to the building line established by Frondeg, on the whole, the principal elevation would be positioned 1.2m behind the building line. A minimum distance of 20.6m would be maintained between the end of the proposed balconies and number 13 St Marks Villas Seaton Street to the north east. A distance of 16m is currently maintained between the front elevations of properties on either side of Seaton Street.

Although concerns have been raised regarding the use of the balconies by tenants, it is considered that the distances maintained would prevent a level of increased overlooking or loss of privacy so detrimental to the residential amenity of those living closest to the site to warrant refusal of the application. It is also considered that the lack of windows in the eastern elevation of the block would prevent overlooking of Frondeg.

Whilst the position and orientation of apartment block one could lead to some increased overshadowing of the rear garden of Frondeg during the late afternoon. It is considered that the levels experienced would not be detrimental to the overall amenity of the property.

During the consultation process, requests have been made by the objectors to reverse the position of the apartment block one and the proposed parking. It is considered that such an alteration would create a larger visual mass of development to the detriment of the character and appearance of the area, and inhospitable living conditions for the proposed apartments as a result of insufficient light and distances being maintained between habitable room windows and blank walls etc.

With regards to the impact of the proposed apartment blocks on the use of the Barry Sidings path at the time of inspection it was noted that the level of the path is significantly raised relative to the floor level of the application. As such it is considered that the lower position of the site relative to the path and the maintenance of 3.6m distance between the proposed buildings and the boundary would prevent the proposal from having a significantly overbearing impact on the users of the pathway.

The proposed site layout indicates that a minimum distance of 18m would be maintained between the northern elevations of the proposed bungalows and the rear (southern) elevations of the dwellings in Barry Road. Whilst a secondary door serving the kitchen would be provided in the northern elevation, no windows are proposed. As such it is considered that the distances maintained in association with the lack of openings and retention of the original boundary wall of the site, would prevent the proposal from generating an increased level of overlooking, loss of privacy or increased level of overshadowing so detrimental to the residential amenity of the properties in Barry Road to warrant refusal of the application on such grounds.

The objectors have also raised concerns with regards to the hours and days of construction and the generation of noise, dust, waste and pollution by construction and haulage traffic. While the hours of construction can be controlled by an appropriately worded condition, matters relating to nuisance generated by noise, dust and waste are dealt with under separate legislation monitored and enforced by the Authority's Public Health and Protection Section.

On the basis of the above it is considered that the development is compliant with the requirements of policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taff Local Development Plan.

## **Highway Safety**

Following consultation, The Authority's Transportation Team has raised no objection to the application subject to conditions and provided the following response:

"Based on the size of the building, it is anticipated that the extant use of the site would have generated more trips than the proposed 14 affordable units.

Access for the 12no. flats would be via Seaton Street. This has a carriageway width of 7.7m with 1.8m footways on either side with no turning area. The terraced nature of the houses along Seaton Street and lack of curtilage parking results in parking on both sides of the carriageway reducing the width to 3.6m which is only sufficient for single file traffic. As a result, residents could park on the footways to facilitate twoway movement and avoid damage to their vehicles. Although this would cause obstruction for pedestrians and damage the fabric of the footway.

Any increase in traffic movements along Seaton Street would exacerbate the current situation and potentially lead to reversing movements to the detriment of all highway users.

The proposal provides a turning area to cater for all calling, service and delivery vehicles entering and leaving Seaton Street in forward gear and bearing in mind that the extant use would have generated more traffic movements than the proposed 12no. one-bedroom affordable units, the proposal is considered acceptable.

The access of Seaton Street would serve 12 dwellings and would therefore need to be designed and constructed to an adoptable standard. There is sufficient space within the curtilage of the site to allow the improvements to be made.

Access for the 2no. two bedroom bungalows would be via an adopted lane off Barry Road. The access lane lacks adequate vision splays which is further exacerbated by on-street parking; substandard width for two way traffic flow; the junction radii and a lack of segregated footway between the site and the local footway network. The proposed access lane serving the site is considered to be unacceptable in terms of highway and pedestrian safety, unless improved to provide 2.0m junction radii, junction give way markings, a speed reducing feature such as rumble strip, 4.8m wide carriageway and 2m wide footway. Such improvements can be achieved within the adopted highway and therefore secured via planning conditions accordingly.

In accordance with the Council's SPG the development has shortfall of 12 parking spaces. However, the proposal is for affordable housing which has a lower level of car ownership and this coupled with the sustainable location of the site in terms of local amenities, public transport and employment is considered acceptable.

Relative to the extant use of the site, it is considered that the proposed development would not increase vehicle movements on Seaton Street and Barry Road to warrant concerns regarding highway capacity. However, there are concerns regarding highway safety and operation, which would require to be mitigated and can be secured via planning condition."

On the basis of the above and subject to the imposition of conditions, it is considered that the development would not have a detrimental impact on the highway safety and free flow of traffic in the area and is compliant with the requirements of policy AW5 of the Rhondda Local Plan.

### **Other Considerations**

### Ecology

The site was cleared of mature trees and vegetation during 2013. None of the trees were protected by a tree preservation order. The plans submitted do indicate that the development would affect the canopy of two goat willows and a number of silver birch trees alongside the Barry Siding path to the south of the site. Guidance with regard to treatment of the trees is currently being sought from the Authority's Arborist. His response will be reported orally at the Meeting.

The preliminary phase one habitat survey, submitted in support of the application, identifies that while there is potential for a number of the buildings on site to be used by bats. On the whole, the site is of low ecological value with no evidence of any species of conservation concern inhabiting or utilising the site.

The bat survey of the buildings identified a considerable level of bat activity in the vicinity, with the main centre building having the greatest potential to support roosting bats. The two other out-buildings were considered to be of moderate value. On further inspection, it was concluded that the property does not presently support roosting bats and has only limited potential to do so. Nor was the building being used by barn owls. As such, the proposed demolition works are considered unlikely to produce any negative impact upon local bat populations.

Following consultation, the Authority's Ecologist has recommended conditions and informative notes with regards to wildlife, tree protection plan for construction.

In light of the survey documents received, the application is considered compliant with policy AW8 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

## Drainage

During the consultation process, an objector has identified that inadequate drainage was provided for the last properties to be built in Seaton Street, leading to problems in the land behind Barry Road. Following consultation Dwr Cymru/Welsh Water have not advised of any capacity issues within the local network and have raised no objection to the application. The Authority's Land Reclamation and Engineering Team have also raised no objection to the application to the application subject to the imposition of conditions relating to drainage. The application is therefore considered compliant with policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

### Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) Liability

The Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) was introduced in Rhondda Cynon Taf from 31 December 2014.

The application is for development of a kind that is liable for a charge under the CIL Regulations 2010 as amended. The application lies within Zone 2 of Rhondda Cynon Taf's Residential Charging Zones, where there is a liability of £40/sqm for residential development (including extensions to dwellings over 100 sqm).

The CIL charge (including indexation) for this development is expected to be £28,394.31. However, social housing relief may be claimed on the development.

## PLANNING OBLIGATIONS

From 6 April 2010 planning obligations should meet all of the following tests in order to comply with the Community Infrastructure Levy legislation:

- (a) necessary to make the development acceptable in planning terms
- (b) directly related to the development; and
- (c) fairly and reasonably related in scale and kind to the development

It is proposed that all of the dwellings are of social rented tenure. The developer will be required to enter into a Section 106 Agreement to ensure that all of the properties are retained for social rented purposes in perpetuity.

It is considered that this requirement meets all of the above tests and is compliant with the relevant legislation.

### RECOMMENDATION

In summary, the proposed development is considered to comply with national and local planning policy and will provide social housing in a sustainable location. The application is recommended for approval subject to conditions.

#### **RECOMMENDATION:** Grant

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of five years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with Sections 91 and 93 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2. The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plan(s) no(s) site location plan; 1474\_4-2 Rev E; 1474\_1-1 Rev C; 1474\_1-2 Rev B; 1474\_1-3; 1474\_3-1; 1474\_3-2; 1474\_3-3 and documents received by the Local Planning Authority on 10/06/2015, 30/06/15 and 24/10/2014, unless otherwise to be approved and superseded by details required by any other condition attached to this consent.

Reason: To ensure compliance with the approved plans and documents and to clearly define the scope of the permission.

3. Notwithstanding the details of the approved plans, development shall not commence other than site clearance and any necessary site remediation until full engineering design and details of the road layout including sections, street lighting details, surface-water drainage, retaining wall, vehicle containment, footways and improvements to the existing highways have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure the adequacy of the proposed development in the interests of highway safety in compliance with policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

4. Prior to the commencement of development, a report indicating a methodology for undertaking a conditions survey of Seaton Street and the junction with the un-named lane and Barry Road affected by the proposed development shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local The report should include: the time-scales for Planning Authority. undertaking the surveys and method(s) of reporting the findings to the Local Planning Authority; comprehensive photographs; and potential compensation arrangements. The development shall not be brought into use until the final survey on completion of the development hereby approved and any compensation arrangements have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure that the extraordinary traffic use arising from the proposed development does not have an adverse impact on highway safety in compliance with policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

- 5. No development shall take place, including any works of site clearance, until a Demolition and Construction Method Statement has been submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority to provide for:
  - the means of access into the site for all demolition and construction traffic;
  - haulage routes to and from the site;
  - the parking of vehicles of site operatives and visitors;
  - the management of vehicular and pedestrian traffic;
  - wheel cleansing facilities; and
  - the sheeting of lorries leaving the site.

The approved Demolition and Construction Method Statement shall be adhered to throughout the process unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interest of highway safety, free flow of traffic and residential amenity in compliance with policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan

6. Surface water run-off from the proposed parking areas shall not discharge onto the pubic highway unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reasons: In the interests of highway safety, in compliance with policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

7. No development shall take place until drainage arrangements have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. No dwelling shall be occupied until the drainage works have been completed in accordance with the approved plans.

Reason: To ensure adequate disposal of foul and surface water drainage in accordance with Policy AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

8. No development shall take place until there has been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority a comprehensive scheme of landscaping, which shall include indications of all existing trees (including spread and species) and hedgerows on the land and details of any to be retained together with measures for their protection during the course of development.

Reason: To ensure that the new development will be visually attractive in the interests of amenity in accordance with Policies AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

9. All planting, seeding or turfing in the approved details of landscaping shall be carried out in the first planting and seeding season following the occupation of the building(s) or completion of the development, whichever is the sooner, and any trees or plants which within a period of five years from the completion of the development die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of similar size and species, unless the Local Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation.

Reason: To ensure that the new development will be visually attractive in the interests of amenity in accordance with Policies AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

10. Building operations shall not be commenced until samples of all the external material proposed to be used, including windows have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and all materials used shall conform to the sample(s) so approved.

Reason: To ensure that the external appearance of the proposed development will be in keeping with the character of the area and adjoining buildings in the interests of visual amenity in accordance with Policies AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

11. No development other than works of site clearance and any necessary site remediation works shall take place until there has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority a plan indicating the positions, design, materials and type of boundary treatment to be erected or retained and repaired. The boundary treatment shall be completed before the building(s) are occupied. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure that the new development will in keeping with the surrounding area and to protect residential amenity in accordance with Policies AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

- 12. No development shall take place until a Wildlife and Tree Protection Plan for Construction has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The plan shall include:
  - An appropriate scale plan showing 'Wildlife and Habitat Protection Zones' where construction activities are restricted;

- Details of protective measures (both physical measures and sensitive working practices) to avoid impact during construction to adjacent trees, cycle track/ footpath and other areas of ecological value;
- A timetable to show phasing of construction activities to avoid periods of the year when sensitive wildlife could be harmed (such as nesting birds season, reptiles and bats);
- Details of specific species and habitat mitigation and monitoring measures for key species (including demolition and provision of bird and bat nesting and roosting features within the fabric of new buildings);
- Details of tree protection measures;
- Details of invasive plant treatment and avoidance;
- Site lighting details;
- Persons responsible for:
  - Compliance with legal consents relating to nature conservation;
  - Compliance with planning conditions relating to nature conservation;
  - Installation of physical protection measures during construction;
  - Implementation of sensitive working practices during construction;
  - Regular inspection and maintenance of physical protection measures and monitoring of working practices during construction;
  - Specific species and Habitat mitigation measures;
  - Provision of training and information about the importance of 'Wildlife and Habitat Protection Zones' to all construction personnel on site.

All construction actives shall be implemented with the approved details and timing of the plan unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interest of ecological and bio-diversity value of the site and wider area, in compliance with policy AW8 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

13. Notwithstanding the details of the approved plans, prior to any development works taking place on the proposed bin and bicycle storage buildings, details of the building, to include external design, finish and siting, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall only proceed in accordance with the approved details and shall be maintained as such thereafter.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenity of the application site, in compliance with policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

- 14. Construction works on the development shall not take place other than during the following times:
  - Monday to Friday 0800 to 1800 hours;
  - Saturday 0800 to 1300 hours;
  - Not at any time on Sundays, Bank or Public holidays, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

All construction HGV deliveries to and from the site shall only take place between the hours of

- 09:00 to 16:30 on weekdays; and
- 09:00 to 13:00 on Saturday only.

Reason: In the interest of highway and pedestrian safety, the free flow of traffic and the residential amenity of those living closest to the site, in compliance with policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

APPLICATION NO:	15/0813/10 (MF)
APPLICANT:	Jones Battye Chartered Surveyors
DEVELOPMENT:	Extension of existing car park (amended red line received 16/07/15)
LOCATION:	ST JOHN BAPTIST HIGH SCHOOL, GLAN ROAD, CWMDARE, ABERDARE, CF44 8BW
DATE REGISTERED: ELECTORAL DIVISION:	16/07/2015 Aberdare West/Llwydcoed

#### **RECOMMENDATION:** Approve

**REASONS:** 

The application is considered to comply with the relevant policies of the Local Development Plan in respect of its visual impact and its potential impact upon the amenity and privacy of the neighbouring properties. Further, the development would have no undue impact upon highway safety in the vicinity of the site and would actually improving some of the current issues experienced by residents of Oxford Street, adjacent to the site.

#### **APPLICATION DETAILS**

Full planning permission is sought for the extension of the existing car park to the northern side of St John the Baptist High School, Cwmdare. The current car park provides 32 off-street car parking spaces for both staff and visitors. It would be

extended to the rear, over a disused area of land within the school site, providing 44 additional off-street parking spaces within the site. No significant engineering works are required given the comparable ground levels of the existing car park and the adjacent land in to which it would be extended. The applicant has stated that the additional spaces are required due to the increasing number of students at the school each year and the subsequent increasing numbers of staff and visitors.

It is also proposed that an access road be created between the new car park and an existing internal road at the rear of the school site. Currently vehicle access to the rear of the school buildings can only be gained from a secondary access off Oxford Street to the rear of the site which often proves problematic due to existing on-street car parking pressure in the narrow terraced street. Therefore the purpose of the new connecting road is to allow vehicle access to the rear of the school site from Glan Road (to the front), eliminating the need for delivery/emergency vehicles to use the schools rear access off Oxford Street.

The application is accompanied by the following:

• Design and Access Statement.

## SITE APPRAISAL

St John the Baptist High School is a typical school site located within a residential area of Cwmdare. It comprises one large school building in the form a of 'U' shape with vehicle parking areas to the front and northern side and yard areas and playing fields to rear and southern side. The main access is off Glan Road to the front with a secondary access being located at the northern-eastern corner (rear) of the site off Oxford Street. The site is bounded by residential properties along the northern and southern boundaries, as well as a number of dwellings within Oxford Street at the north-eastern corner.

# PLANNING HISTORY

Previous applications at the site submitted within the last 10 years:

15/0884	St John the Baptist High School, Glan Road, Cwmdare	To install 3 no. temporary buildings to be used as additional classroom facilities. To be reviewed after 3 years.	Pending
14/1176	St John the Baptist High School, Glan Road, Cwmdare	Two temporary portacabin buildings for additional office accommodation.	Granted 13/11/14
11/1454	St John the Baptist High School, Glan	Two storey extension to provide lift, W.C. and classroom area.	Granted 07/02/12

Road, Cwmdare

- 11/0952 St John the Proposed two storey extension to Granted Baptist High provide a lift, W.C. and classroom 15/09/11 School, Glan area. Road, Cwmdare
- 10/0549 St John the The provision of various disabled Granted Baptist High School, Glan Road, Cwmdare
- 05/0855 St John the Baptist High School, Glan Reveated roof space of the Science and Music block. Replacement of existing flat roof Granted 29/07/05 Granted 29/07/05

# PUBLICITY

The application has been advertised by means of direct neighbour notification and site notices. Four letters of objection have been received from surrounding residents, making the following comments (summarised):

- Given the narrow nature of Oxford Street and the fact that residents have no
  off-street parking, there are currently significant issues with delivery vehicles
  accessing the rear of the school via the Oxford Street access. The street can
  often become blocked due large vehicles trying to access the rear of the
  school and resident's on-street parking along the street. Concerns that any
  development at the school would exacerbate these problems.
- Concerns that the introduction of 44 additional car parking spaces at the site may result in increased traffic to the school. This would have a detrimental impact upon highway safety in the locality.
- The application forms are incorrect. The applicant has stated that the site is not within 20 metres of a watercourse, however, a culvert runs under the site.
- The development would increase flood risk to the surrounding properties.
- Concerns that a number of trees within the school site may be removed having a detrimental impact upon the amenity of surrounding residents and the local ecology.

In addition to the comments made above, two letters of support were also received, making the following comments (summarised):

• Pleased that the school has acknowledged the current parking and access issues along Oxford Street and has sought to alleviate them through the introduction of additional parking and access for delivery vehicles off Glan Road.

# CONSULTATION

Transportation Section – no objection, subject to a condition being added to any consent in respect of vehicular access, both during and after construction, being restricted to Glan Road only.

Land Reclamation and Engineering – no objection, subject to standard conditions.

Public Health and Protection – no objection.

Countryside, Landscape and Ecology – no objection.

Natural Resources Wales – no objection.

## POLICY CONTEXT

### Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan

The application site lies within the settlement boundary for Aberdare, but is not allocated for any specific purpose.

**Policy CS1** – sets out the criteria for development in the Northern Strategy Area.

**Policy AW2** – supports development in sustainable locations and includes sites that are accessible by a range of sustainable transport modes and would not unacceptably conflict with surrounding uses.

**Policy AW5** – sets out criteria for new development in relation to amenity and accessibility.

**Policy AW6** – requires development to involve a high quality design and to make a positive contribution to place making, including landscaping.

**Policy AW10** – does not permit proposals where they would cause or result in a risk of unacceptable harm to health and/or local amenity.

**Policy NSA12** – identifies the criteria for assessment of development proposals within and adjacent to settlement boundaries.

### National Guidance

In the determination of planning applications regard should also be given to the requirements of National Planning Policy which are not duplicated in the Local Development Plan, particularly where National Planning Policy provides a more up to date and comprehensive policy on certain topics.

Planning Policy Wales Chapter 2 (Development Plans), Chapter 3 (Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions), Chapter 4 (Planning for Sustainability), and Chapter

8 (Transport) set out the Welsh Government's policy on planning issues relevant to the determination of the application.

Other relevant policy guidance consulted:

PPW Technical Advice Note 12: Design.

PPW Technical Advice Note 18: Transport.

## REASONS FOR REACHING THE RECOMMENDATION

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purposes of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Furthermore, applications that are not in accordance with relevant policies in the plan should not be allowed, unless material considerations justify the grant of planning permission.

### Principle of the Proposed Development

The application site lies within settlement limits and represents an established educational and community facility. The proposal seeks to provide improved services for staff and visitors through the construction of a car park extension, as well as improving the existing access to the rear of the site by creating a connecting road from the front of the site to alleviate the current access and parking issues along Oxford Street adjacent to the site. As such, it is considered that in principle, the proposal is acceptable, subject to an assessment of the criteria below.

### Visual Impact

The application proposes the extension of the existing car park and the installation of a small connecting road to the northern side of the main school building. Whilst the development would inevitably form a visible feature within the site, given its siting and the minimal engineering works required, it is not considered the works would appear overly prominent or out of keeping with the wider school site. Furthermore, given the nature the proposed works and the relationship they would have with the nearest properties, the resulting development would not be readily visible from any public vantage points off the adjacent highway or from the surrounding residential properties which are screened from the site by a mature band of trees which are to remain.

Therefore, in the context of the whole site, the proposals represent relatively modest additions that are required in order to improve the current facilities at the school and the access and parking arrangements within the adjacent street. Consequently, it is not considered that the proposal would be harmful to the character of the site or its wider setting.

## **Residential Amenity**

Given the minor nature of the proposed works and their siting in from the boundaries of the nearest residential dwellings, it is not considered that the proposed development would adversely affect the levels of amenity and privacy currently enjoyed by local residents.

The nearest residential properties are sited over 20 metres from the proposed development and are also screened from the school by a band of mature trees along the northern boundary. It is noted that an objector has commented that they are concerned with the removal of these trees and the potential impact it may have upon the levels of amenity and privacy they currently enjoy, however, the plans details that the trees would remain post development and applicant has clearly stated that this would be the case within the Design and Access Statement. As such, the proposal is considered acceptable in this regard.

### **Highway Safety**

Following consultation, the Transportation Section has raised no objection to the application subject to a condition being added to any consent relating to the restriction of access off Oxford Street to the rear of the site during and after development.

It was noted that visibility onto Glan Road is sub-standard which is of concern, but given the benefits of providing an additional 44 off-street parking spaces at the site, taking the total to 99 which will significantly reduce on-street car parking congestion in and around the school, especially during dropping off and picking times, this issue alone would not warrant a highway objection.

In respect of the connecting road from the new car park to the rear of the site, it was commented that the use of the secondary access off Oxford Street often proves problematic due to the narrow nature of Oxford Street and existing on-street car parking pressure within it. Vehicles are forced to park on the footways to maintain a running width for vehicular traffic to the detriment of safety of all highway users and free flow of traffic which also increases maintenance liability for the Council. Therefore, the proposed access road through the car park to the rear of the school will remove the need for the Oxford Street access to be utilised by vehicles which will significantly improve highway safety along Oxford Street and in the vicinity of the site. However, there is some concern that by providing a link to Oxford Street from the car park that staff and parents would be tempted to use Oxford Street as rat run which would be to the detriment of safety of all highway users and free flow of traffic. Therefore, a condition has been suggested that the Oxford Street access be used for emergency access only and the gates shall remain closed with access off Glan Road only both during and after development.

Consequently, in light of the highways assessment above, whilst it is acknowledged that there has been some concern in respect of highway safety from local residents,

subject the condition below, it is considered the scheme would actually improve highway safety in the locality and the application is therefore acceptable in this regard.

## Land Drainage and Flood Risk

It is noted that a number of objectors have commented that the proposed works may have the potential to increase flood risk to the surrounding properties and that a culvert runs through the site despite the fact that the applicant has stated the site is not within 20 metres of a watercourse in the application forms. However, whilst it is acknowledged the proposed hard-surfacing will inevitably increase surface water run-off in the vicinity of the works, consultation has been undertaken with the Council's Land Reclamation and Engineering Section and Natural Resources Wales with a view to assessing any potential impacts upon land drainage and flood risk respectively. Their responses raise no objection to the planning application subject to standard conditions requesting full drainage details be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to any works starting on site. It is therefore considered that adequate drainage facilities can be installed on site and the application is acceptable in this regard, subject to the conditions detailed below.

# Other Issues

It is noted that consultation has also been undertaken with the Council's Public Health and Protection Division and Countryside, Landscape and Ecology Section with a view to assessing any potential impacts upon public health and ecology respectively. Their responses raise no objection to the planning application or suggest any conditions to be added to any consent.

# Community Infrastructure Levy Liability

The Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) was introduced in Rhondda Cynon Taf from 31 December 2014.

The application is for development of a kind that is not CIL liable under the CIL Regulations 2010 (as amended).

# Conclusion

It is not considered the development would have any undue impact upon the character and appearance of the locality or upon the amenity of the surrounding properties. Furthermore, there would be no impact upon highway safety in the vicinity of the site and the development would actually improve a number of the current access and parking issues experienced by residents of Oxford Street adjacent to the site. As such, the application is considered to comply with the relevant policies of the Local Development Plan and is recommended for approval, subject o the conditions detailed below.

#### **RECOMMENDATION:** Grant

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of five years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with Sections 91 and 93 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2. The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans ref. 01 and 02 and documents received by the Local Planning Authority on 15/06/15 and 16/07/15, unless otherwise to be approved and superseded by details required by any other condition attached to this consent.

Reason: To ensure compliance with the approved plans and documents and to clearly define the scope of the permission.

3. No development shall take place until drainage arrangements have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure adequate disposal of foul and surface water drainage in accordance with Policy AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

4. The development hereby approved shall not be brought into beneficial use until the drainage works have been completed in accordance with the approved plans.

Reason: To ensure adequate disposal of foul and surface water drainage in accordance with Policy AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

5. Vehicular access to and from the site during and after construction shall be restricted to Glan Road with emergency access only off Oxford Street unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety and free flow of traffic in accordance with policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

6. Prior to the commencement of development, details of wheel washing facilities shall be provided on site in accordance with details to be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The approved details shall be implemented and maintained throughout the construction period unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of highway and pedestrian safety and to ensure that mud and debris are not deposited onto the public highway in

accordance with policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

7. Surface water run-off from the proposed development shall not discharge onto the public highway or connected to any highway drainage system unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To prevent overloading the existing highway drainage system and potential flooding and in the interests of highway safety in accordance with policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

- 8. Construction works on the development shall not take place other than during the following times:
  - Monday to Friday 0800 to 1800 hours
  - Saturday 0800 to 1300 hours
  - Nor at any time on Sundays, Bank or Public holidays, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure that the noise emitted from this development is not a source of nuisance to occupants of nearby residential properties in accordance with Policy AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

APPLICATION NO: APPLICANT: DEVELOPMENT:	15/0884/10(GW)St John Baptist CIW High SchoolTo install 3 no. temporary buildings to be used as additional classroom facilities. To be reviewed after 3 years.
LOCATION:	ST JOHN BAPTIST HIGH SCHOOL, GLAN ROAD, CWMDARE, ABERDARE, CF44 8BW
DATE REGISTERED: ELECTORAL DIVISION:	21/07/2015 Aberdare West/Llwydcoed

#### **RECOMMENDATION: GRANT**

#### **REASONS:**

The proposed temporary buildings would provide additional classroom space for an increase in the number of students. They would be sited in an area not easily visible from surrounding viewpoints. Nevertheless, they are temporary in nature and would not be in character with the existing school building. Accordingly, a temporary permission of three years is recommended in this particular instance.

#### Two local residents have raised concerns with an increase in on street parking in the area. No objection has been raised on highway safety grounds.

## **APPLICATION DETAILS**

Planning permission is sought for the provision of three temporary buildings for additional classroom space. The reason for this is that there has been an influx of students and consequently staff numbers have increased to meet the demand. A 3 year permission is required to meet the immediate need until a longer term solution is found.

The pre-fabricated type buildings would be located to the southern part of the school site close to the existing buildings and within an area that has been used as a garden area. Two of the buildings would measure 7.33m in length, 3.655 m in depth and 2.7m in height and would be placed in one line. The other one would be placed to form an 'L' shape with the others. This one would measure 6.2m in length, 5.3m in depth and with a height of 2.9m.

The application is accompanied by the following:

• Design and Access Statement

### SITE APPRAISAL

St John Baptist High School is sited within the residential area of Cwmdare. It occupies a relatively large site with the main access being to the west of Glan Road and a secondary pedestrian access off Oxford Street to the northeast. The nearest neighbouring properties are to the west and north of the site. To the south of the site is an area of woodland bordering the River Dare.

### PLANNING HISTORY (Recent and relevant to application)

15/0813	St John Baptist High School, Glan Road, Cwmdare	Extension of existing car park	Pending
14/1176	St John Baptist High School, Glan Road, Cwmdare, Aberdare	Two temporary portacabin buildings for additional office accommodation	Granted 13/11/14
11/1454	St John Baptist High School, Glan Road, Cwmdare, Aberdare	Two storey extension to provide a lift, w.c. and classroom area.	Granted 07/02/12
11/0952	St John Baptist High	Proposed two storey extension	Granted

	School, Glan Road, Cwmdare, Aberdare	to provide a lift, w.c. and classroom area.	15/09/11
10/0549	St John's Baptist High School, Glan Road, Aberdare	The provision of various disabled access ramps to exits around the school.	Granted 02/07/10
05/0855	St John The Baptist Church In Wales Comprehensive School, Glan Road, Gadlys, Aberdare	Replacement of existing flat roof with new pitched roof and incorporation of store room into new pitched roof space of the Science and Music block.	Granted 29/07/05
99/4342	St.John The Baptist Comprehensive School, Glan Road, Gadlys, Aberdare.	Extension To Existing Assembly/Dining Hall And Kitchen.	Granted 17/09/99
98/4131	St.John The Baptist Comprehensive School, Glan Road, Gadlys, Aberdare.	Construction Of Sports Hall, Changing Rooms And Storage.	Granted 11/05/98
96/4056	St.John The Baptist Comprehensive School, Glan Road, Gadlys, Aberdare.	Construction Of 2 Storey Classroom Block And Single Storey Annexe. Etc. (Access From Glan Road.)	Granted 09/09/96
95/0476	St.John The Baptist Comprehensive School, Glan Road, Gadlys, Aberdare.	Retention OF Temporary Classroom Accommodation. (Renewal Of Consent 93/0221).	Granted 22/11/1995 – Temporary Consent To 31/12/98
95/0277	St.John The Baptist Comprehensive School, Glan Road, Gadlys, Aberdare.	Temporary Classroom Accommodation.	Granted 04/09/1995 – Temporary Consent To 31/12/98
93/0221	St.John The Baptist Comprehensive School, Glan Road, Gadlys, Aberdare.	Temporary Classroom Accommodation. (Amendment To Previously Approved Scheme.)	Granted 29/06/93
92/0777	St.John The Baptist Comprehensive School, Glan Road,	Temporary Classroom	Granted 01/02/93

Gadlys, Aberdare.

# PUBLICITY

The application has been advertised via site notice and direct neighbour notification. Two objections have been received and their comments are summarised below:

- Concerned with regard impact of an increase in school numbers on traffic and parking.
- Any expansion in the 6<sup>th</sup> form would increase on street parking, due to students coming and going during the day.
- The additional parking should be provided prior to the classrooms.
- Oxford Street should not be used for the delivery of these classrooms.

# CONSULTATION

Land Reclamation and Engineering – no objection subject to drainage condition.

Public Health and Protection - no objection subject to conditions on demolition of existing dwellings, hours of operation, noise, dust, waste and site contamination.

Transportation Section – no objection subject to a condition requiring access during and after construction is from Glan Road

# POLICY CONTEXT

# Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan

The application site is identified as within the settlement boundary and is unallocated.

**Policy CS2** - sets out criteria for achieving sustainable growth including, focussing development within defined settlement boundaries.

**Policy AW2** - advises that development proposals on non-allocated sites will only be supported in sustainable locations.

**Policy AW5** - sets out criteria for new development in relation to amenity and accessibility.

**Policy AW6** - requires development to involve a high quality design and to make a positive contribution to place making, including landscaping.

**Policy AW10** - development proposals must overcome any harm to public health, the environment or local amenity.

## Supplementary Planning Guidance

Access, Circulation & Parking Design and Placemaking

#### National Guidance

In the determination of planning applications regard should also be given to the requirements of National Planning Policy which are not duplicated in the Local Development Plan, particularly where National Planning Policy provides a more up to date and comprehensive policy on certain topics.

Planning Policy Wales Chapter 2 (Development Plans), Chapter 3 (Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions), Chapter 4 (Planning for Sustainability) and Chapter 7 (Economic Development) set out the Welsh Government's policy on planning issues relevant to the determination of the application.

Other relevant policy guidance consulted: PPW Technical Advice Note 11: Noise; PPW Technical Advice Note 12: Design; PPW Technical Advice Note 18: Transport; PPW Technical Advice Note 23: Economic Development

### REASONS FOR REACHING THE RECOMMENDATION

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purposes of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Furthermore, applications that are not in accordance with relevant policies in the plan should not be allowed, unless material considerations justify the grant of planning permission.

### Principle of the proposed development

The application relates to the provision of additional classrooms at an existing school and within the defined settlement boundary. The principle of the development is therefore acceptable subject to other material planning considerations which are assessed below.

#### Impact on the character and appearance of the area

In terms of the visual impact, the temporary classrooms would be sited in relatively close proximity to the main school building. It is accepted that they would visually be temporary in nature and would not fully integrate with the school building. Nevertheless, they would be sited in a non-conspicuous location and are not considered to be overly detrimental to the visual amenities of the surrounding area. Furthermore, the permission can be restricted so that the temporary buildings are removed after a period of three years. This would allow the school to decide on a more permanent solution after the temporary period. Therefore, the proposal is considered to be acceptable in this regard.

### Access and Parking

The temporary buildings would be located within the school site and access and parking would be the same as for the existing building. The main access is off Glan Road and a secondary access to the site is from Oxford Street.

Two objections have been received detailing they consider the development would result in an increase in parking within the surrounding streets. The applicant has acknowledged the classrooms are for 6<sup>th</sup> form students at that staff numbers would increase. As such there maybe some increase in the need for car parking.

The Council's Transportation Section do not object and detail additional off-street parking would be available as a result of the current application to provide an extended car park (15/0813). They require a condition that access during and after construction be restricted to Glan Road with emergency access only off Oxford Street. Whilst it is acknowledged the access from Oxford Street maybe poor there is no known restriction to its use. Furthermore a condition requiring the users of the new classroom do not use the Oxford Street access would be extremely difficult to enforce. It is however considered a condition requiring construction/delivery vehicles use Glan Road during the provision of the classrooms would be enforceable. As such it is suggested the condition suggested by the Transportation Section is amended to take out the reference to 'after construction'.

An objector suggests a condition requiring the classrooms are only used once the associated extended car park has been provided. It is considered this would be an acceptable way of requiring the additional parking is in place to benefit users of the classroom and is suggested as an additional condition to the one put forward by the Transportation Section.

The Transportation Section has been informed of the above and do not object to the amended and additional condition.

### Impact on residential amenity and privacy

The proposed temporary buildings would be situated to the south of the main school building. They would be a significant distance from nearby dwellings and their relatively small size would not result in any significant issue to residential amenity.

## **Other Issues**

The following other material considerations have been taken into account in considering the application, though were not the key determining factors in reaching the recommendation.

### Public Health

Whilst the other comments provided by the Public Health and Protection Section are appreciated, it is considered as the nearest residential properties are some distance away construction noise, dust and waste matters can be more efficiently controlled by other legislation. An appropriate note can be added to any permission concerning waste and dust issues. With regard the hours of construction condition, the development is located sufficient distance from other residential dwellings so as not to be a nuisance.

### Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) Liability

The Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) was introduced in Rhondda Cynon Taf from 31 December 2014.

The application is for development of a kind that is not CIL liable under the CIL Regulations 2010 (as amended).

### Conclusion

The application is considered to comply with the relevant policies of the Local Development Plan in respect of the principle of development, impact on the character and appearance of the area, the impact on access and parking and the impact on residential amenity (Policies AW2, AW5 and AW6).

### **RECOMMENDATION:** Grant

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of five years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with Sections 91 and 93 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

- 2. The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans:
  - Plan View received on 25<sup>th</sup> June 2015
  - Elevations received on 25<sup>th</sup> June 2015
  - Block plan received on 25<sup>th</sup> June 2015

and documents received by the Local Planning Authority on 23<sup>rd</sup> June 2015 and 21<sup>st</sup> July 2015, unless otherwise to be approved and superseded by details required by any other condition attached to this consent.

Reason: To ensure compliance with the approved plans and documents and to clearly define the scope of the permission.

3. The development hereby permitted shall be permanently removed from the site and the land restored to its former condition within 3 years of the date of this decision notice.

Reason: To define and limit the extent of the permission and to protect the visual amenity of the area in accordance with Policies AW5 and AW6 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

4. Vehicular access to and from the site during construction shall be restricted

to Glan Road with emergency access only off Oxford Street unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety and the free flow of traffic in accordance with Policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

5. The classrooms hereby permitted shall not be used until the extended car park, proposed in application reference 15/0813/10, has been fully provided.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety and the provision off street parking in accordance with Policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

6. No development shall take place until drainage arrangements have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Prior to the first beneficial use of the buildings hereby permitted the drainage works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure adequate disposal of foul and surface water drainage in accordance with Policy AW10 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

APPLICATION NO:	15/0945/11 (JM)
APPLICANT:	RCT CBC Countryside Section
DEVELOPMENT:	Repair and cleaning of the memorial to Evan James and James James, at Ynysangharad Park, Pontypridd.
LOCATION:	YNYSANGHARAD PARK, BRIDGE STREET, PONTYPRIDD, CF37 4PE.
DATE REGISTERED: ELECTORAL DIVISION:	03/07/2015 Trallwn

#### **RECOMMENDATION:** Approve

#### **REASONS:**

The proposed works are essential to not-only halt the decay and safeguard the special architectural and historic interest of the monument, but to subtly restore much of its former aesthetic.

**APPLICATION DETAILS** 

Listed Building Consent is sought for the removal of the two Goscombe sculptures to a studio for restoration and the removal, repair and restoration of the broken Evan James stone sarcophagus cover (stone cover).

These proposals specifically consist of:

- removal of the two sculptures to a studio;
- remote removal of the sculptures' internal amateurs and replacement with non-ferrous alternatives;
- repair of the sculptures' expanded and rusted outer sections and reapplication of lacquered finish;
- removal of the sarcophagus' stone cover to a workshop;
- replacement of the existing discoloured mortar repair with an appropriately matched stone or a mortar on amateurs carved to the original profile;
- cleaning of stone cover and re-gilding of lettering;
- cleaning and minor rearrangement of the memorial's approach and boundary stones

## SITE APPRAISAL

This site is located in Ynysangharad Park, on the eastern side of Pontypridd town centre and the River Taff. The memorial is on the eastern side of the park, to the north of the bandstand.

### History

The Evan James – James James memorial is in Ynysangharad Park, a war memorial park created in 1923. Goscombe John erected sculptures in 1930 to commemorate Evan James (1809-78) and his son James James (1832-1902). The stone cover of Evan James was moved here from Carmel chapel, where he was buried, before Carmel was demolished. The complete arrangement was later listed as a single Grade II\* memorial to the composers of the Welsh National Anthem.

## Exterior

The memorial is composed of 2 bronze figures in Celtic robes: a man holding a harp, representing music, and a woman representing poetry. They stand on a base of pennant stone brought from Craig yr Hesg, with memorial inscriptions in English and Welsh and a bronze tablet with low relief portrait busts between them. To the rear is a date stone. The base stands on a stepped plinth, in front of which is the enriched saddleback grave slab of Evan James. In front of the memorial are 2 low square piers and a steel grille, beyond which are approach steps with dwarf wall and square piers, all of rock-faced stone with rock-faced copings. The paved approach is inlaid with a Celtic cross in stone.

### Listed

Listed grade II\* for its national historical interest as commemorating the composers of the Welsh National Anthem, and as an important public sculpture by one of Wales' foremost C20 sculptors. (Cadw, 2001)

## PLANNING HISTORY

Members will be aware that there are a number of developments within the Ynys Angharad Park site, none of which relate to the Evan James, James James memorial.

14/0937	Ynysangharad Park Lido, Bridge Street, Pontypridd	New play area	Granted 09/09/14
13/0796	Ynysangharad Park Lido, Bridge Street, Pontypridd	Alterations to approved plans for Grade II Ynysangharad War Memorial Park Lido	Conditions 18/12/13
13/0795	Ynysangharad Park Lido, Bridge Street, Pontypridd	Alterations to approved plans for Grade II Ynysangharad War Memorial Park Lido	Conditions 27/09/13
12/0536	Ynysangharad Park, Bridge Street, Pontypridd,	Restoration of the Ynysangharad Park Grade II listed Lido to an operational facility.(Listed Building Consent).	Conditions
12/0535	Ynysangharad Park, Bridge Street, Pontypridd	Restoration of the Ynysangharad Park grade II listed Lido to an operational facility. Works to include the restoration of the pool area, cubicles, and lido buildings. New build elements include an extended all weather changing facility, café and first floor historical interpretation centre.	Conditions 03/10/12
03/1161	The Lido, Ynysangharad Park, Pontypridd.	Repairs to sections of roof, including replacement of existing roof tiles. (Listed Building Application)	Permission Not Required 18/08/03
95/0041	Ynysangharad War Memorial Park, Pontypridd	Change of Use of Old Cafe, Basket Room, First Aid & Toilet to an indoor children's play centre.	Conditions 09/03/95

93/0696	Ynysangharad War
	Memorial Park

Leisure pool featuring 3 pools Conditions with ancillary facilities. 06/10/93

# PUBLICITY

The application has been advertised by direct notification to neighbouring properties. A press notice and site notifications of works were also displayed however, no comments have been received.

## CONSULTATION

The following responses were received from consultees: -

- The Twentieth Century Society noted that, 'the strategy appears to be sensible and well thought through, by an experienced restoration consultancy'. However, did not feel they had the expertise to comment on the monument restoration and requested the Public Monuments and Sculpture Association be consulted.
- Victorian Society did not feel they were qualified to comment on the technical aspects of the object conservation, deferring instead to the Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings
- Public Monuments and Sculpture Association will not comment on monument Conservation
- Cadw responded that proposed development will not impact on the registered historic parks and gardens, however, noted that the application for Listed Building Consent would be a matter for the authority to make a recommendation upon.

The following have been consulted however, no responses were received: -

- Ancient Monument Society
- Council for British Archaeology
- Royal Commission for Ancient Historic Monuments of Wales
- Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings
- Georgian group

## POLICY CONTEXT

### Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan

There is no statutory requirement to have regard to the provisions of the development plan when considering applications for Listed Building Consent.

### National Guidance

## Planning Policy Wales

Para.**6.5.9** Where a development proposal affects a listed building or its setting, the primary material statutory consideration is to special regard to preserving the building setting and features.

Para. **6.5.10** Applicants for listed building consent must be able to justify their proposals, to show why alteration of a listed building is desirable or necessary.

## Other policy guidance considered:

Welsh Office Circular 61/96 (98)

PPW Technical Advice Note 12 – Design

# REASONS FOR REACHING THE RECOMMENDATION

The application is in accordance with national policy, legislation and guidance and should therefore be acceptable in terms of Listed Building Consent.

### Main Issue:

The principle consideration in determining an application for Listed Building Consent is whether or not the impact of the works are acceptable in terms of the special architectural and historic merit of the Listed Building; in line with the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

## Current proposal

Goscombe sculptures: The sculptures are currently suffering from significant rusting and expansion of the internal metallic armatures causing a 'jacking' action, which has split one sculpture, whilst ferrous stains have run down the plinths.

Urgent remedial action is therefore necessary if further, potentially irreversible damage is to be avoided. The method of armature removal will be remote, somewhat similar to keyhole surgery, followed by flushing of the residue and oven drying. The sculptures will then be repaired with non-ferrous metals and made watertight with a re-applied finish. As no visual evidence of the original patination survives, laboratory analysis will seek to establish this. If none can be confirmed, the most likely finish in line with Goscombe's work, the period and material will be used. Not re lacquering is not an option if the sculptures are to be protected and not be disfigured after repair.

The cleaning of the plinths and surrounding stonework will be carried out to remove the ferrous staining from the monument and restore the intended clean and even 1930's design. Evan James sarcophagus: The cap stone is all that remains of the original grave, chapel and home of a figure of national significance. As such the repairs will be controlled in the manner of 'historic object conservation'; due to the relative rarity of the remaining piece and its social and historic significance.

This is particularly relevant as the piece has suffered a breakage at the corner, which stops millimetres short of the original inscription. General masonry would allow for cutting back to clean edges for a 'scarf' or 'Dutchman repair', however, this would require the loss of yet more of the capstone and the inscription. The sourcing of a stone, similar in both appearance and make-up that it will not cause a thermal or moisture differential, is also problematic. Such problems cause deterioration at the joint, which lead to short lived repairs and likely damage through the inscription area.

The existing discoloured repair appears to be a lime rich mortar, carved to the profile of the missing piece. This repair is correct in terms of conservation principles, in that it has been made sacrificial to the main stone and has not required the cutting away to insert. It has however, become discoloured over time and began to deteriorate, in that it, rather than the stone absorbs the water and suffers freeze thaw action. In so much as this is the case, the repair has worked perfectly, it has taken damage rather than the original stone.

Conservation knowledge has progressed significantly over recent decades however, and the use of lime mortar and armatures is now widespread; and petrographic analysis accessible and cost effective. As such, the proposed repair will be conditioned to again be sacrificial; although it is considered that a much more longevity should be expected given the technical advances in past decades.

It should be noted however, that this repair will also require replacement at some point in the future, although as this is sacrificial, it should be possible to carry this out again without damaging the original stone. The stone cleaning will also be controlled to be minimal and sensitive, where it is necessary to avoid the deterioration of the stone, not to remove the natural patina of age. Likewise the inscription will be controlled to ensure it is 'picked out' in guild or paint, rather than re-cut.

The original stone apron to the sarcophagus is thought to have been a plain solid plinth of likely local pennant; the re-introduction of such a piece will return a sense of the tomb's original appearance, whilst integrating it well for the first time with the Goscombe sculptures, which use the same material.

## Conclusion

The proposed works are essential to remedy serious and rapid deterioration of the Goscombe sculptures and to restore the Evan James sarcophagus cover to an undamaged appearance. Their associated restoration will be closely conditioned in line with the best-practice in conservation of historic objects.

## **RECOMMENDATION:** Approve (subject to favourable referral to Cadw)

### **RECOMMENDATION:** Grant

1. The development hereby granted consent shall be begun not later than the expiration of five years beginning with the date of this consent.

Reason: To comply with Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Area) Act 1990.

- 2. Notwithstanding the approved plans, the design and detailed specification of the following shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, prior to the recommencement of works:
  - (a) matching stone type to be determined by petrographic analysis;
  - (b) masonry cleaning method statement;
  - (c) mortar specification;
  - (d) schedule of replaced or rearranged masonry;
  - (e) method statement for the saddleback repair;

The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure that the appearance of the proposed works will be in keeping with the special architectural and historic character of the listed building in accordance with Policy AW7 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

- 3. For the avoidance of doubt, the works shall be carried out in accordance with the following details: -
  - Wall and floor structures are to use vapour permeable traditional lime mortars and no tanking or impervious materials should be used.
  - The sculpture repair shall be carried out in accordance with the recommendations within the 'Condition Survey and Treatment Recommendations' (Hall Conservation, January 20<sup>th</sup> 2015.

Reason: In order to minimise the potential for damage to the historic fabric of the listed building, in accordance with Policy AW7 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan

### LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT 1972

#### as amended by

## LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985

## RHONDDA CYNON TAF COUNTY BOROUGH COUNCIL

## LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS

## **DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE**

## 17 SEPTEMBER 2015

### **REPORT OF: SERVICE DIRECTOR PLANNING**

<u>REPORT</u>

#### OFFICER TO CONTACT

APPLICATIONS RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL

MR J BAILEY (Tel: 01443 425004)

**See Relevant Application File**