

# PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

#### 19 APRIL 2018

## REPORT OF THE SERVICE DIRECTOR, PLANNING

#### **PURPOSE OF THE REPORT**

Members are asked to determine the planning application outlined below:

APPLICATION NO: 16/1028/10 (EL)
APPLICANT: Mr Brett Summers

**DEVELOPMENT:** - Conversion of adjoining storage barn to living

accommodation and associated new opening - Installing new window in existing opening

- Installing new external door in existing opening

- Replacement windows

- New internal opening connecting living room and

kitchen

- Re-roofing porch

- General maintenance.

LOCATION: PANTYDDRAINAN FARM, LLANTRISANT ROAD,

CASTELLAU, BEDDAU, PONTYCLUN, CF72 8LQ

DATE REGISTERED: 20/09/2016 ELECTORAL DIVISION: Tonyrefail East

Recommendation: APPROVE SUBJECT TO CONDITIONS

## **REASONS:**

The proposal is in keeping with policies AW5 and AW7 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan and National Policy in that, the existing, adjoining barn is capable of conversion to provide additional living accommodation for the existing dwelling, without major external alteration or reconstruction. The conversion along with other works including the replacement of windows, reroofing of the porch and general maintenance are not considered to adversely affect either the character or settling of the Listed Building. The scheme is also considered acceptable in terms of the potential impacts on residential amenity, highway safety and ecology.

## **Reason Application Reported To Committee**

The applicant is a serving Elected Member or their immediate family;

## **APPLICATION DETAILS**

Full planning permission is sought for a series of alterations to: Pantyddrainan Farm, Llantrisant Road, Castellau, Beddau. The works involve:

The conversion of an adjoining storage barn to living accommodation. As part of the conversion the formation of a new doorway is proposed between the existing kitchen and proposed barn conversion (which would be utilised as a dining room). To the west elevation an existing blocked up opening would be re-opened and a timber casement window fitted. To the north elevation an existing full height opening which is currently blocked-up would be re-opened and a glazed unit installed, with an existing lintel being made good. A further existing doorway and lintel at ground floor level would be repaired. To the east elevation an existing blocked up opening would be re-opened by the installation of timber glazed French doors. New glazing would be also added to an existing opening in the east elevation.

As part of the conversion, the design would also incorporate the provision of bat loft. This would be accommodated within the roof space of the existing barn. A small bat access slot (measuring 200x300mm) would be installed in the north gable elevation of the barn.

- Replacement windows. It is proposed that the windows be replaced. Existing
  openings would be retained with new double glazed softwood sash windows
  being installed. Many of the replacement windows in the original property
  (excluding the proposed conversion) have been installed.
- New internal opening connecting living room and kitchen. The plans illustrate
  the retention of an internal opening which has been formed between the living
  room and kitchen of the property.
- Re-roofing porch, with salvaged slate tiles from the site.

A number of maintenance and repair works, these include:

- The sub-division of the existing bathroom and the opening up of the existing plaster-boarded ceiling to roof level along with the re-instatement of a high level blocked up opening which serves this space.
- Repairs to an external stonework boundary wall.
- Repairs to the former 'bake house' outbuilding. These include making good a
  lintel over a and a doorway and re-instatement of a door and glazed unit.
  Replacing existing corrugated metal sheet roofing with slate tiles to match the
  farmhouse, installing new fascia and guttering. Making good stone coping to
  bake house chimney.
- Back-filling a gulley which runs along the western boundary of the property.

The planning application is accompanied by;

A conservation statement prepared by Gillard Associates

 A survey for bats and nesting birds dated October 2016, with addendums dated October 2017 and December 2017. This identifies the barn is used by Natterer's bats and identifies mitigation by way of the provision of a bat loft as part of the conversion.

An application for Listed Building Consent (16/1040/12) has also been submitted and appears elsewhere on this agenda.

#### SITE APPRAISAL

The application site consists of a Grade II Listed farmhouse, its out buildings and curtilage and are described in the formal Listing as Pant y Ddraenan. The site is located in a low-lying position on a track which runs east off the lane from Pant y Brad to Castellau. The house is understood to have sub-medieval origins and was rebuilt in the 1830s. The farmhouse is a two storey construction with rear wing and is constructed of rubble stone with slate roof. The primary elevation of the building faces south with a gabled porch. The Listing identifies that the rear wing was a hay barn with loft over. Immediately to the south of the farmhouse is an outbuilding described as a 'bake house' this is connected to the main house by a stone boundary wall. The application also includes some repairs to this building. The applicants have indicated that their ownership includes the farm house and it's out buildings along with an area of land to the north and south of the buildings. The site is located in an isolated countryside location with no neighbouring properties in the immediate vicinity of the site. Records indicate that the site is crossed by Public Right of Way ANT/130/1 and ANT/124/1, however neither route are affected by the proposals.

#### PLANNING HISTORY

16/1040/12 Pantyddrainan Farm, Llantrisant Road, Castellau, Beddau, Pontyclun, CF72 8LQ Listed Building Consent for the following:-

- Conversion of adjoining storage barn to living accommodation and associated new opening
- Installing new window in existing opening
- Installing new external door in existing opening
- Replacement windows
- New internal opening connecting living room and kitchen
- Re-roofing porch.
- General maintenance

Not yet determined

#### **PUBLICITY**

The application was advertised by site notices. One letter of representation has been received which is summarised as follows:

The letter is from the Open Spaces Society and makes reference to the fact that footpaths lie close to the building where the works are proposed. Assurances are sought that the proposals will not adversely affect the public use and enjoyment of the public footpath.

#### CONSULTATION

Countryside & Ecology – no objections raised. The application is accompanied by a survey for bats and nesting birds dated October 2016, with addendums dated October 2017 and December 2017. This identifies the barn is used by Natterer's bats and identifies mitigation by way of the provision of a bat loft as part of the conversion.

Natural Resources Wales – no objections raised, subject to the use of a condition which prevents the commencement of conversion works until the applicant has provided the Local Planning Authority with a licence that has been issued by Natural Resources Wales pursuant to Regulation 53 of the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations (2010).

Public Health & Protection – no objections raised, condition relating to site investigations suggested.

#### **POLICY CONTEXT**

# Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan

Indicates that the site lies outside of settlement limits in a sandstone resources area and Special Landscape Area.

Policy AW1 sets out the requirements for new housing development and the methods by which the provision of new housing will be met. AW1.5 refers directly to the conversion of suitable structures to provide housing.

Policy AW2 promotes development in sustainable locations.

Policy AW5 sets out criteria for new development in relation to amenity and accessibility.

Policy AW6 sets out the criteria for new development in terms of design and placemaking.

Policy AW7 provides a criteria for the protection and enhancement of the historic built environment.

Policy AW8 provides a criteria for the protection and enhancement of the natural environment.

Policy AW9 provides a criteria for the alteration, renovation or conversion of existing buildings outside the defined settlement boundaries

SSA 13 sets out the criteria for development within settlement boundaries.

SSA23 identifies a number of Special Landscape Areas. The site lies within Mynydd y Glyn and Nant Muchudd Basin.

## National Guidance

Planning Policy Wales Chapter 3 (Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions), Chapter 6 (Conserving the Historic Environment), Chapter 8 (Transport) and Chapter 9 (Housing), set out the Welsh Government's policy on planning issues relevant to the determination of the application.

#### REASONS FOR REACHING THE RECOMMENDATION

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purposes of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Furthermore, applications that are not in accordance with relevant policies in the plan should not be allowed, unless material considerations justify the grant of planning permission.

#### Main Issues

Full planning permission is sought for a series of works at Pantyddrainan Farm, Llantrisant Road, Castellau, Beddau. The works are summarised in full above, however the main aspects of the scheme involve:

- The conversion of an adjoining storage barn to provide additional living accommodation at ground floor level.
- Replacement windows both in the original dwelling and the re-instatement of openings and installation of new windows in the proposed barn conversion.
- The retention of a newly formed internal opening between the living room and kitchen of the original farmhouse.
- Re-roofing porch, with salvaged slate tiles from the site.
- A number of maintenance and repair works, within the building and its curtilage.

The key considerations in determining this application are the compatibility of the proposed extended residential use, in relation to existing land uses, the potential impact of the works upon the character and appearance of both the listed building and its immediate countryside setting; and the potential impact upon the amenity and privacy of the occupiers of nearby properties. The impact of the proposed conversion upon highway safety is a further consideration.

## Principle of development

It is noted that the application site is located outside of the defined settlement limits, in an area defined as open countryside. Whilst it is accepted that planning policy aims primarily to restrict development in countryside locations, instead promoting

development in sustainable locations, it is noted that in certain instances the alteration, conversion and re-use of rural buildings may be acceptable in policy terms, subject to compliance with a series of criteria.

Whilst policy AW9 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan sets out the criteria, which must be met when considering proposals that seek to create new residential units by the conversion of rural buildings; in this case, it is noted that a dwelling already exists on the site. Pantyddrainan Farm is an established farmhouse and whilst the house is no longer occupied in conjunction with the operation of an agricultural unit, it is occupied as a residential dwelling.

The main aspect of the current works relates to the conversion of a barn, which is attached to the rear of the farmhouse, in order to form additional living accommodation. The plans do not involve the subdivision of the building and therefore do not seek to create an additional unit of accommodation. As such, it is considered that the principle of the conversion of the barn is acceptable, subject to appropriate assessment of the impacts upon the character and setting of the listed building, amenity of nearby properties and highway safety.

# Character, Appearance and Impacts upon status as a Listed Building

As set out above, the property is a Grade II Listed Farmhouse which comprises the main dwelling, attached barn, which would have acted as a hayloft, a bake house and various other outbuildings which sit within the curtilage of the property. The property is described as a rare example of a remote, historic, farming property in good state of repair, which makes Pantyddrainan Farm, a fine example of Welsh agricultural and built heritage. As such, it is essential that any works proposed to the building and its setting are sensitively undertaken and do not adversely affect either the character or setting of the listed building.

The planning application is accompanied by a conservation statement, which provides a detailed assessment of the building and how it has evolved over time. Within the conservation statement is a design strategy, which states that the applicants wish to "fully utilise structures for their living arrangements and to conserve and enhance the character of the property. The proposals to the rear wing (old hay barn) aim to reinstate existing features whilst providing a comfortable environment which cultivates an appreciation of the building character."

In planning terms, the main aspect of the works relate to the conversion of the hay barn to living accommodation. The plans and conservation statement confirm that the conversion works would be undertaken within the fabric of the existing building, with no increases in either footprint or scale proposed. A survey of the building has revealed a number of openings previously existed in the structure but over time have been blocked up. The proposal involves the re-opening of these and the insertion of suitable window casements. Photographic evidence in the conservation statement, clearly identifies the location of each of these openings. It is noted that a new opening is proposed between the existing kitchen and hay barn conversion to provide necessary circulation. However, the opening dimensions would be limited to match the scale of an existing door on the opposite wall. Other works such as the

re-instatement of a mezzanine floor in the space and the removal of a modern concrete floor slab are proposed as part of the conversion.

Overall, having assessed the proposals it is considered that the conversion works carefully take account of the historic character of the building and provide an opportunity to bring back into use, albeit for a residential purpose, a part of the building which has been unused for a number of years. It is considered that the proposals have been sensitively designed and the proposed conversion would not appear out of keeping with the character of the building as a whole, or harmful to its status as a listed building.

In terms of the proposed works to the windows, the conservation statement confirms that a number of the existing windows are in need of replacement. The applicants commissioned double glazed soft wood horned sash windows and it is understood that a number of these have been installed. A series of photographs showing the replacement units in-situ have been provided by the applicant.

It is acknowledged that the introduction of new units clearly means the loss of some historic windows. However, the conservation statement makes it clear that whilst the proportions of the existing 6 over 6 pane and 3 over 3 pane windows are pleasing, these would not have been original or even authentic. Similarly, elsewhere windows such as the kitchen window have previously been replaced in a mock Georgian style, which does little to enhance the character of the property. Whilst it is acknowledged that the replacement windows would obviously be new additions, it is noted that their style and design reflects that of the original property, being 3 over 3 horned sash units. Overall, on balance, it is considered that the replacement windows are acceptable in terms of their impacts upon the character and appearance of the listed building.

Having assessed the scheme, other repair works within the curtilage of the building are also considered acceptable. The proposals to re-roof the porch with salvaged tiles along with the repair works to the bake house are considered appropriate as they seek to restore some the existing features of the building, whilst also providing an opportunity to bring the structure back into use. Similarly, minor internal modifications, such as the re-instatement of a high level blocked up opening in the bathroom and the removal of a modern plaster boarded ceiling are not considered to be harmful to the character of the property.

Whilst the above-mentioned works are considered acceptable, some concern is expressed with regard to one aspect of the internal modifications proposed. The modifications in question relate to the formation of an internal opening connecting the existing lounge and kitchen. This aspect of the works is also retrospective. However, since this aspect of the works relates to an internal alteration to the existing building, this matter is covered in greater detail in the Listed Building Consent application, which appears elsewhere on this agenda (app. Ref. no. 16/1040/12).

Overall, with the exception of the retrospective internal works, to form an opening between the kitchen and existing lounge; on balance, it is considered that the proposed conversion works are acceptable and other repair and improvement works detailed as part of the project would not result in an unacceptable degree of harm to either the appearance of the original building or its wider countryside setting.

# Residential amenity

The barn is positioned within the existing farmyard; as such it forms part of a group of buildings, which include the farm house out buildings. However, the unit occupies an isolated rural position accessed via a network of lanes. As such, the closest residential units are located some 0.6km north west and 0.75km south east and are largely screened from view by intervening landscape features. As such, the proposed works would not adversely affect the privacy or amenity of neighbouring occupiers.

## Highway Safety

In terms of highway safety, the site is accessed via a network of rural lanes. Whilst the application seeks to increase the level of living accommodation at the property by way of the conversion of an existing barn, it does not propose the formation of any new units of residential accommodation. Furthermore, the conversion would not result in an increase in bedroom numbers at the property. As such, it is not considered that the proposals would result in an increase in parking requirements at the site. Furthermore, the existing means of access to the site and car parking layout would be retained. The site is accessed via single track lane, which serves only the dwelling and the property itself benefits from a parking area to the west of the farmhouse. No changes to either the access or the parking arrangements are proposed as part of the planning application. As such, it is not considered that the proposed works would result in an adverse impact upon highway safety in the vicinity, therefore the scheme accords with the requirements of policy AW5 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

## Other Issues

The following other material considerations have been taken into account in considering the application, though were not the key determining factors in reaching the recommendation.

#### Ecology

As set out above, consideration must be given to the potential impact of the development upon protected species, most notably bats.

In support of this, the application is accompanied by an ecological survey, which focuses on protected species, undertaken by David Clements Ecology. This identifies the barn is used by Natterer's bats and identifies mitigation by way of the provision of a bat loft as part of the conversion. This document has been reviewed by both the Council's Ecologist and Natural Resources Wales who, have confirmed that they are satisfied with the findings of the report and the scheme of mitigation proposed. Nevertheless, as the works to the convert the barn will affect a space that is used by a protected species, then the works will have to be carried out under a licence which is issued by Natural Resources Wales. Therefore, whilst NRW raise

no objections to the planning application, they recommend the use of a condition, which requires the applicant to obtain the necessary licence prior to commencement of development.

Overall, it is considered that the mitigation proposed will adequately overcome earlier concerns identified in relation to potential impacts upon protected species, notably Natterers Bats. As such, no objections have been raised by either NRW or the Council's Ecologist and the scheme accords with the requirements of policy AW8 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local development Plan.

#### Contamination

It is noted that consultation with the Council's Public Health & Protection Section has suggested that there may be a potential for contamination to exist on site. It is suggested this may be the case as the barn may have been used for the storage of pesticides or similar substances which may have been used when the farm was operational. As such, a site investigations condition is suggested. Whilst these comments are noted, it is understood that the unit has not operated as a working farm for a number of years and the barn to be converted is directly attached to the main farmhouse. As such, should Members be minded to approve planning permission, then it is suggested that an informative note be attached to the permission granted, drawing the applicant's attention to the need to consider the previous use of the building and if necessary incorporate any appropriate mitigation measures in the design of the conversion.

# Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) Liability

The Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) was introduced in Rhondda Cynon Taf from 31 December 2014.

The application is for development of a kind that is not CIL liable under the CIL Regulations 2010 (as amended).

## Conclusion

Having taken account of all of the issues outlined above, the proposed conversion of the attached hay barn to provide additional living accommodation is considered appropriate, with the conversion works being undertaken largely within the fabric of the existing structure. Furthermore, other repair and maintenance works are also considered acceptable.

Whilst concern remains with regard to the element of the works which relates to the un-consented opening that has been formed between the existing kitchen and living space, this matter is considered in greater detail within the accompanying Listed Building Consent application, which appears elsewhere on this agenda.

Therefore the proposal is recommended for approval, subject to the conditions specified below.

RECOMMENDATION: GRANT SUBJECT TO THE CONDITIONS BELOW:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of five years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with Sections 91 and 93 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

- 2. The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plan(s) no(s)
  - Drawing no C215/AL(0)1 Rev P OS Site Plan
  - Drawing no C215/AL(0)2 Rev P Existing Site Plan (1)
  - Drawing no C215/AL(0)3 Rev P Existing Ground Floor Plan
  - Drawing no C215/AL(0)4 Rev P Existing Elevations 1
  - Drawing no C215/AL(0)5 Rev P Existing Elevations 2
  - Drawing no C215/AL(0)6 Rev P Existing Section
  - Drawing no C215/AL(0)7 Rev P1 Proposed Ground Floor Plan
  - Drawing no C215/AL(0)8 Rev P1 Proposed Elevations 1
  - Drawing no C215/AL(0)9 Rev P1 Proposed Elevations 2
  - Drawing no C215/AL(0)10 Rev P1 Proposed Section
  - Conservation Statement /DAS & Appendix 1 (Listing) 2 (Windows) 3 (Proposed Openings)

and documents received by the Local Planning Authority on 27/10/16, 28/03/17, 16/10/17 & 11/12/17 unless otherwise to be approved and superseded by details required by any other condition attached to this consent.

Reason: To ensure compliance with the approved plans and documents and to clearly define the scope of the permission.

3. The proposed conversion shall be undertaken in accordance with the mitigation measures set out within the accompanying Ecology Reports; notably: Section 5.0 Recommendations of the report entitled: Barn at Pant y Ddraenen Farm: Update survey for Bats v2 by David Clements Ecology dated December 2017.

Reason: In the interest nature conservation in accordance with Policies AW5 and AW8 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

- 4. Bats and their breeding sites and resting places are protected under the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2010 (as amended). Where bats are present and a development proposal is likely to contravene the legal protection they are afforded, the development may only proceed under licence issued by Natural Resources Wales, having satisfied the three requirements set out in the legislation. A licence may only be authorised if:
  - i. the development works to be authorised are for the purpose of preserving public health or safety, or for other imperative reasons of overriding public interest, including those of a social or economic

nature and beneficial consequences of primary importance for the environment.

- ii. There is no satisfactory alternative and
- iii. The action authorised will not be detrimental to the maintenance of the population of the species concerned at a favourable conservation status in its natural range.

No development shall commence until the applicant has provided a copy of a licence to the Local Planning Authority, that has been issued by Natural Resources Wales pursuant to Regulation 53 of the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations (2010) authorising the specified activity/development to go ahead.

Reason: In the interest nature conservation in accordance with Policies AW5 and AW8 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan and Planning Policy Wales.

- 5. Notwithstanding the approved plans, prior to the commencement of the development, the design and detailed specifications, including finishing materials, of the following shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority
  - a) Timber casement windows in barn conversion
  - b) Timber glazed doors in barn conversion
  - c) rainwater goods and fascias;
  - d) replacement windows;

The works shall be carried out strictly in accordance with these approved details.

Reason: To ensure that the appearance of the proposed works will be in keeping with the special architectural and historic character of the listed building in accordance with Policy AW7 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.