



PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

19 APRIL 2018

REPORT OF THE SERVICE DIRECTOR, PLANNING

PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

Members are asked to determine the planning application outlined below:

APPLICATION NO: 16/1040/12 (EL)
APPLICANT: Mr Brett Summers
DEVELOPMENT: Listed Building Consent for the following:-
- Conversion of adjoining storage barn to living accommodation and associated new opening
- Installing new window in existing opening
- Installing new external door in existing opening
- Replacement windows
- New internal opening connecting living room and kitchen
- Re-roofing porch.
- General maintenance

LOCATION: PANTYDDRAINAN FARM, LLANTRISANT ROAD, CASTELLAU, BEDDAU, PONTYCLUN, CF72 8LQ

DATE REGISTERED: 15/09/2016
ELECTORAL DIVISION: Tonyrefail East

RECOMMENDATION - APPROVE SUBJECT TO CONDITIONS AND THE REQUIRED CONSULTATION WITH THE WELSH GOVERNMENT.

REASONS:

The alterations proposed are considered to be in line with relevant guidance and legislation relating to the protection of Listed Buildings. The proposed conversion of the attached former hay barn to living accommodation would bring back into practical use this element of the building. The schedule of works is considered to be sympathetic to the fabric of the listed building and seek to restore a number of historic features, having no undue impact upon its setting. As such, the application is considered to comply with the relevant policies and guidance of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

REASON APPLICATION REPORTED TO COMMITTEE

- The applicant is a serving Elected Member or their immediate family;

APPLICATION DETAILS

Listed Building consent is sought for a series of alterations to Pantyddrainan Farm, Llantrisant Road, Castellau, Beddau. The works involve:

- The conversion of an adjoining storage barn to living accommodation. As part of the conversion the formation of a new doorway is proposed between the existing kitchen and proposed barn conversion (which would be utilised as a dining room). To the west elevation an existing blocked up opening would be re-opened and a timber casement window fitted. To the north elevation an existing full height opening which is currently blocked-up would be re-opened and a glazed unit installed, with an existing lintel being made good. A further existing doorway and lintel at ground floor level would be repaired. To the east elevation an existing blocked up opening would be re-opened by the installation of timber glazed French doors. New glazing would be also added to an existing opening in the east elevation.

As part of the conversion, the design would also incorporate the provision of bat loft. This would be accommodated within the roof space of the existing barn. A small bat access slot (measuring 200x300mm) would be installed in the north gable elevation of the barn.

- Replacement windows. It is proposed that the windows be replaced. Existing openings would be retained with new double glazed softwood sash windows being installed. Many of the replacement windows in the original property (excluding the proposed conversion) have been installed.
- New internal opening connecting living room and kitchen. The plans illustrate the retention of an internal opening which has been formed between the living room and kitchen of the property.
- Re-roofing porch, with salvaged slate tiles from the site.

A number of maintenance and repair works, these include:

- The sub-division of the existing bathroom and the opening up of the existing plaster-boarded ceiling to roof level along with the re-instatement of a high level blocked up opening which serves this space.
- Repairs to an external stonework boundary wall.
- Repairs to the former 'bake house' outbuilding. These include making good a lintel over a doorway and re-instatement of a door and glazed unit. Replacing existing corrugated metal sheet roofing with slate tiles to match the farmhouse, installing new fascia and guttering. Making good stone coping to bake house chimney.
- Back-filling a gully which runs along the western boundary of the property.

The planning application is accompanied by;

- A conservation statement prepared by Gillard Associates
- Appendix 1 – Listing Report, Appendix 2 – Proposed windows Appendix 3 – Proposed openings.

An application for full planning permission (16/1028/10) has also been submitted and appears elsewhere on this agenda.

SITE APPRAISAL

The application site consists of a Grade II Listed farmhouse, its out buildings and curtilage and are described in the formal Listing as Pant y Ddraenan. The site is located in a low-lying position on a track which runs east off the lane from Pant y Brad to Castellau. The house is understood to have sub-medieval origins and was rebuilt in the 1830s. The farmhouse is a two storey construction with rear wing and is constructed of rubble stone with slate roof. The primary elevation of the building faces south with a gabled porch. The Listing identifies that the rear wing was a hay barn with loft over. Immediately to the south of the farmhouse is an outbuilding described as a 'bake house' this is connected to the main house by a stone boundary wall. The application also includes some repairs to this building. The applicants have indicated that their ownership includes the farm house and it's out buildings along with an area of land to the north and south of the buildings. The site is located in an isolated countryside location with no neighbouring properties in the immediate vicinity of the site. Records indicate that the site is crossed by Public Right of Way ANT/130/1 and ANT/124/1, however neither route are affected by the proposals.

PLANNING HISTORY

| | | | |
|------------|---|--|--------------------|
| 16/1028/10 | Pantyddrainan Farm, Llantrisant Road, Castellau, Beddau, Pontyclun, CF72 8LQ | Full planning permission for the following:- - Conversion of adjoining storage barn to living accommodation and associated new opening - Installing new window in existing opening - Installing new external door in existing opening - Replacement windows - New internal opening connecting living room and kitchen - Re-roofing porch. - General maintenance | Not yet determined |
|------------|---|--|--------------------|

PUBLICITY

The application was advertised by direct neighbour notification site and press notice. No representations have been received.

CONSULTATION

Royal Commission on the Ancient Historical Monuments of Wales – no response or comments received.

Ancient Monument Society - no response or comments received.

The Twentieth Century Society - no response or comments received.

Council for British Archaeology Wales/Cymru - no response or comments received.

The Georgian Group – no response or comments received.

The Victorian Society - no response or comments received.

The Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings – comments received. They comment that they are, in principle, supportive of the application to convert the adjacent barn to living accommodation; however concern is expressed with regard to the un-consented opening that has been formed between the existing kitchen and living room of the 'original' farm house.

Glamorgan Gwent Archaeological Trust – no objections raised, however in order to both mitigate the impacts of the works and to provide further detail on the origins of the building, information on its construction, details of its architectural features and a history of its development should be obtained and recorded. GGAT recommend that the proposed recording should take place both prior to and during the undertaking of the works, as they are likely to expose the historic core and should be done under archaeological supervision. A condition to this effect is recommended.

POLICY CONTEXT

Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan

Indicates that the site lies outside of settlement limits in a sandstone resources area and Special Landscape Area.

There is no statutory requirement to have regard to the provisions of the development plan when considering applications for Listed Building Consent. The importance of a site of architectural and historic interest is however acknowledged under policy AW7 and Supplementary Planning Guidance: The Historic Built Environment:

Policy AW7 provides a criteria for the protection and enhancement of the historic built environment. The policy identifies that proposals which impact upon sites of architectural or historic merit will only be permitted where it can be demonstrated that the proposal would preserve or enhance the character of the area, in line with national guidance and legislation.

Supplementary Planning Guidance: The Historic Built Environment: gives detailed guidance to owners and occupiers of land and buildings within the historic built environment, and anyone wishing to develop within it or make alterations to it.

National Guidance

Planning Policy Wales Chapter 3 (Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions) and Chapter 6 (Conserving the Historic Environment), set out the Welsh Government's policy on planning issues relevant to the determination of the application.

Other relevant policy guidance consulted:

PPW Technical Advice Note 12: Design;

PPW Technical Advice Note 24: The Historic Environment;

REASONS FOR REACHING THE RECOMMENDATION

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purposes of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Furthermore, applications that are not in accordance with relevant policies in the plan should not be allowed, unless material considerations justify the grant of planning permission.

Main Issues

Principle of development

Listed Building consent is sought for a series of works at Pantyddrainan Farm, Llantrisant Road, Castellau, Beddau. The works are summarised in full above, however the main aspects of the scheme involve:

- The conversion of an adjoining storage barn to provide additional living accommodation at ground floor level.
- Replacement windows both in the original dwelling and the re-instatement of openings and installation of new windows in the proposed barn conversion.
- The retention of a newly formed internal opening between the living room and kitchen of the original farmhouse.
- Re-roofing porch, with salvaged slate tiles from the site.
- A number of maintenance and repair works, within the building and its curtilage.

The principle consideration in determining an application for Listed Building Consent is whether or not the impact of the works are acceptable in terms of the special architectural and historic merit of the listed building, in line with the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

Impacts upon the historic character and appearance of the building

As set out above, the property is a Grade II Listed Farmhouse which comprises the main dwelling, attached barn, which would have acted as a hayloft, a bake house and various other outbuildings which sit within the curtilage of the property. The property is described as a rare example of a remote, historic, farming property in good state of repair, which makes Pantyddrainan Farm, a fine example of Welsh agricultural and built heritage. As such, it is essential that any works proposed to the building and its setting are sensitively undertaken and do not adversely affect either the character or setting of the listed building.

The proposed works would broadly fall in to two categories, these being; firstly the works to enable the conversion of the attached hay barn to form additional living accommodation and secondly, works which may be classed as repairs and alterations to the existing farmhouse and structures within its curtilage.

Barn conversion

The application is accompanied by a conservation statement, which provides a detailed assessment of the building and how it has evolved over time. Within the conservation statement is a design strategy, which states that the applicants wish to “fully utilise structures for their living arrangements and to conserve and enhance the character of the property. The proposals to the rear wing (old hay barn) aim to reinstate existing features whilst providing a comfortable environment which cultivates an appreciation of the building character.”

In planning terms, the principle of the conversion of the hay barn to living accommodation is considered acceptable. The plans and conservation statement confirm that the conversion works would be undertaken within the fabric of the existing building, with no increases in either footprint or scale proposed. It is noted that a new opening is proposed between the existing kitchen and hay barn conversion to provide necessary circulation. However, the opening dimensions would be limited to match the scale of an existing door on the opposite wall. Other works such as the re-instatement of a mezzanine floor in the space and the removal of a modern concrete floor slab are proposed as part of the conversion.

A survey of the building has revealed a number of openings previously existed in the structure but over time have been blocked up. The proposal involves the re-opening of these and the insertion of suitable window casements. It is noted that the response from the Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings (SPAB) expresses

some concern with regard to the size of the opening proposed to enable the insertion of French doors to the east elevation. However photographic evidence, which accompanies the conservation statement, clearly identifies the location of each of the proposed openings and demonstrates that an openings would have existed in each of these positions previously. In the case of the French doors in question (identified as existing infill b – Appendix 3) an infill of a combination of stonework, brickwork and blockwork is clearly evident, which the agents suggest would have dated from the mid – late 20th century and may have been modified more than once over its lifetime. Having assessed the supporting information and evidence presented it is not considered that the proposed formation of these openings would adversely affect the character of the listed building.

Overall, having assessed the proposals it is considered that the conversion works carefully take account of the historic character of the building and provide an opportunity to bring back into use, albeit for a residential purpose, a part of the building which has been unused for a number of years. It is considered that the proposals have been sensitively designed and the proposed conversion would not appear out of keeping with the character of the building as a whole, or harmful to its status as a listed building.

Windows

In terms of the proposed works to the windows, the conservation statement confirms that a number of the existing windows are in need of replacement. The applicants commissioned double glazed soft wood horned sash windows and it is understood that a number of these have been installed. A series of photographs showing the replacement units in-situ have been provided by the applicant.

Again it is acknowledged that the observations from SPAB comment that they would prefer to see the refurbishment of the existing units rather than their replacement. They also comment that the photographs of the house show that there was a mix of window sizes and styles which lends character and interest to the elevations. Whilst it is acknowledged that the introduction of new units clearly means the loss of some historic windows. However, the conservation statement makes it clear that whilst the proportions of the existing 6 over 6 pane and 3 over 3 pane windows are pleasing, these would not have been original or even authentic. Similarly, elsewhere windows such as the kitchen window have previously been replaced in a mock Georgian style, which does little to enhance the character of the property. Whilst it is acknowledged that the replacement windows would obviously be new additions, it is noted that their style and design reflects that of the original property, being 3 over 3 horned sash units. Overall, on balance, it is considered that the replacement windows are acceptable in terms of their impacts upon the character and appearance of the listed building.

Repairs and Internal Alterations

Having assessed the scheme, other repair works within the curtilage of the building are also considered acceptable. The proposals to re-roof the porch with salvaged slates along with the repair works to the bake house are considered appropriate as they seek to restore some of the existing features of the building, whilst also providing an opportunity to bring the structure back into use. Similarly, minor internal modifications, such as the re-instatement of a high level blocked up opening in the bathroom and the removal of a modern plaster boarded ceiling are not considered to be harmful to the character of the property.

Whilst the above-mentioned works are considered acceptable, some concern is expressed with regard to one aspect of the internal modifications proposed. The modifications in question relate to the formation of an internal opening connecting the existing lounge and kitchen. This aspect of the works is also retrospective.

As noted above, whilst the observations from the Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings (SPAB) have confirmed that they are generally supportive of the principle of the conversion of the barn to living accommodation, they express serious concerns with regard to the un-consented opening that has been formed between the existing kitchen and living space. Their concerns note that the formation of the opening has resulted in damage to what appears to be the masonry above the sub-medieval footprint of the building, commenting that it is possible that this masonry was some of the oldest at the farmhouse. SPAB comment that as there was previously a connection between the original farmhouse and kitchen there would be little justification for forming a new opening within this significant masonry, had the un-consented works not been undertaken. Their observations conclude by stating that they are of the opinion that these damaging un-consented works should not be retained and that the opening should be closed up and internal finishes to the lounge wall made good. As such, should Members be minded to approve Listed Building Consent, then a condition is recommended which would require the permanent closing up of the doorway in question.

Conclusion

Overall, with the exception of the retrospective internal works, to form an opening between the kitchen and existing lounge; on balance, it is considered that the proposed conversion works are acceptable and other repair and improvement works both within the main building and structures within its curtilage, detailed as part of the project would not result in an unacceptable degree of harm to either the appearance of the listed building or its setting. Therefore Listed Building Consent is recommended, subject to the conditions specified below and the required consultation with the Welsh Government.

RECOMMENDATION: GRANT SUBJECT TO CONDITIONS AND THE REQUIRED CONSULTATION WITH THE WELSH GOVERNMENT.

1. The development hereby granted consent shall be begun not later than the expiration of five years beginning with the date of this consent.

Reason: To comply with Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Area) Act 1990.

2. The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plan(s) no(s)

- Drawing no C215/AL(0)1 Rev P OS Site Plan
- Drawing no C215/AL(0)2 Rev P Existing Site Plan (1)
- Drawing no C215/AL(0)3 Rev P Existing Ground Floor Plan
- Drawing no C215/AL(0)4 Rev P Existing Elevations 1
- Drawing no C215/AL(0)5 Rev P Existing Elevations 2
- Drawing no C215/AL(0)6 Rev P Existing Section
- Drawing no C215/AL(0)7 Rev P1 Proposed Ground Floor Plan
- Drawing no C215/AL(0)8 Rev P1 Proposed Elevations 1
- Drawing no C215/AL(0)9 Rev P1 Proposed Elevations 2
- Drawing no C215/AL(0)10 Rev P1 Proposed Section
- Conservation Statement /DAS & Appendix 1 (Listing) 2 (Windows) 3 (Proposed Openings)

and documents received by the Local Planning Authority on 27/10/16, 28/03/17, 16/10/17 & 11/12/17 unless otherwise to be approved and superseded by details required by any other condition attached to this consent.

Reason: To ensure compliance with the approved plans and documents and to clearly define the scope of the permission.

3. Notwithstanding the approved plans, the doorway opening, formed without consent between the kitchen and lounge (as illustrated on drawing no. C215/AL(0)7 Rev P1 Proposed Ground Floor Plan) shall be permanently closed with masonry infill and walls made good to match original, prior to the creation of the new opening, hereby consented between the kitchen and the barn conversion.

Reason: To mitigate the unauthorised and destructive works to the sub-medieval core of the listed building, returning the plan-form, appearance and use pattern to these historic spaces, in accordance with the requirements of policy AW7 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan and Planning Policy Wales.

4. No works to the conversion of the barn shall commence until an appropriate program of historic building recording and analysis has been secured and implemented in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has first been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: The building is of architectural and cultural significance, the specified records are required to mitigate any impacts arising from the development, in accordance with the requirements of policy AW7 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

5. Notwithstanding the approved plans, prior to the commencement of the development, the design and detailed specifications, including finishing materials, of the following shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority
 - a) Timber casement windows in barn conversion
 - b) Timber glazed doors in barn conversion
 - c) rainwater goods and fascias;
 - d) replacement windows;

The works shall be carried out strictly in accordance with these approved details.

Reason: To ensure that the appearance of the proposed works will be in keeping with the special architectural and historic character of the listed building in accordance with Policy AW7 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan.

6. Notwithstanding the approved plans, any re-pointing of stonework shall be undertaken with the use of a lime mortar to match that of the original building.

Reason: To ensure that the appearance of the proposed works will be in keeping with the special architectural and historic character of the listed building in accordance with Policy AW7 of the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Development Plan